Business Paper

Council Meeting

Monday, 18 September 2017
6:30pm

Council Chambers,
Level 2, Administration Building
4-20 Eton Street, Sutherland
ORDER OF BUSINESS

1. ACKNOWLEDGEMENT OF COUNTRY

2. OPENING PRAYER
   Father Michael Court – St John Bosco, Engadine

3. APOLOGIES

4. DISCLOSURES OF INTEREST

5. CONFIRMATION OF MINUTES OF THE PREVIOUS MEETING

6. PRESENTATIONS

7. MAYORAL MINUTES

8. REPORTS OF THE CORPORATE GOVERNANCE COMMITTEE HELD ON 4 SEPTEMBER 2017
   GOV006-18 Appointment of Councillors to Committees
   GOV007-18 Cash Payments & Investments Report - July 2017
   GOV008-18 Writing-Off of Rates and Charges Under Delegated Authority for the Period 1 January 2017 to 30 June 2017

9. REPORTS OF THE SHIRE INFRASTRUCTURE COMMITTEE HELD ON 4 SEPTEMBER 2017
   INF008-18 Ocean Grove Avenue Cronulla Redevelopment

10. REPORTS OF THE SHIRE PLANNING COMMITTEE HELD ON 4 SEPTEMBER 2017
    PLN011-18 IHAP002-18 Demolition of existing structures, construction of a multi dwelling housing development containing 4 dwellings including basement car parking and two swimming pools - Actinotus Avenue, Caringbah South - (DA17/0135)
    PLN012-18 Pre-Development Application Discussion Service for Single Dwelling Houses
    PLN013-18 Audit of Aluminium Composite Panel Facade Cladding in the Sutherland Shire
    PLN014-18 NSW RFS Planning for Bushfire Protection

11. REPORTS OF THE SHIRE SERVICES COMMITTEE HELD ON 4 SEPTEMBER 2017
    SER003-18 Proposed Sale of Land - 45B Langer Ave, Caringbah South
    SER004-18 Release of Easement at 5 Woodford Crescent, Heathcote
    SER005-18 Grants and Subsidy Program
12. REPORTS FROM OFFICERS
   COR004-18 Report and Minutes of the Meetings of the Sutherland Traffic and Traffic
   Safety Committee and Consultative Traffic Forum held on Friday, 1
   September 2017
   COR005-18 Cronulla Town Centre Traffic Study - Preliminary Report on the 6 Month Trial
   of No Left Turn into Cronulla Street

13. MOTIONS OF WHICH NOTICE HAS BEEN GIVEN
   MOT006-18 Determining Body for Development Applications
   MOT007-18 Working Party on Energy Generation

14. PRESENTATION OF PETITIONS

15. QUESTIONS

16. NON AGENDA ITEMS

17. CONSIDERATION OF BUSINESS IN CLOSED SESSION

18. CONFIDENTIAL REPORTS OF THE SHIRE SERVICES COMMITTEE HELD ON 4
    SEPTEMBER 2017
   SER002A-18 Proposed Sublease of SSHED Lease at 1 Pitt Street, Loftus

19. CONFIDENTIAL REPORTS FROM OFFICERS
EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

- At the Council meeting held on 4 October 2016 the current Council meeting structure for the Council term was endorsed.
- Subsequently at its meeting held on 24 October, 2016 Council appointed Councillors as members of various Council Committees and delegates to various external bodies.
- Council has traditionally reviewed the membership of Committees on an annual basis in line with the election of the Mayor. Despite the move to two year Mayoral terms it is still considered appropriate to review Committee Membership on an annual basis.
- This report provides an opportunity for Council to review Councillor membership of Committees for the next 12 month period.

COMMITTEE RECOMMENDATION

THAT:

1. The existing Councillors appointed as members of each Standing Committee and Sub-Committee and as Council representatives on External Bodies as listed in Appendix "A" be re-appointed.

2. An additional Councillor/s be appointed as members of the Aboriginal Advisory Sub-Committee and Floodplain Risk Management Committee.

3. A Councillor be appointed as an Alternate Member of the Sydney Airport Community Forum

4. A Councillor be appointed as CoChairperson of Youth Council
GOV007-18  CASH PAYMENTS & INVESTMENTS REPORT – JULY 2017

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

- This report provides details of Council’s investment performance for the period ending 31 July 2017, along with presenting cash and investment balances and diversification.
- Council may invest funds that are not, at any particular time, required for any other purpose. Investment of these funds must be in accordance with relevant legislation and regulations and in accordance with Council’s Policy for Investment of Cash Balances. Details of these investments must be reported to Council monthly.
- The return on Council’s portfolio to 31 July 2017 was 2.82% compared to the benchmark of 1.73%.
- All investments have been made in accordance with legislative requirements and within relevant Council policy.

COMMITTEE RECOMMENDATION

That the information concerning Bank Balances and Investments held as at 31 July 2017, be received and noted.
GOV008-18 WRITING-OFF OF RATES AND CHARGES UNDER DELEGATED AUTHORITY FOR THE PERIOD 1 JANUARY 2017 TO 30 JUNE 2017

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

• The purpose of this report is to advise Council of the amounts written-off for rates and charges which have been approved by the General Manager under delegated authority as required by the Local Government (General) Regulation 2005.

• For the six months ended 30 June 2017, a total of $6,904.01 representing Rates, Domestic Waste Management Charges, Dishonoured Cheque Fees, Interest Charges and Legal Costs has been written-off.

• The majority of amounts written off are related to properties that have become non-rateable or have been the result of a change in rating categorisation.

• Consideration of this Report by Council ensures that all relevant legislative requirements are satisfied in respect of rates and charges that have been written-off.

COMMITTEE RECOMMENDATION

That the report on "Writing-Off of Rates and Charges Under Delegated Authority for the Period 1 January 2017 - 30 June 2017", be received and noted.
REPORTS OF THE SHIRE INFRASTRUCTURE COMMITTEE HELD ON 4 SEPTEMBER 2017

INF008-18     OCEAN GROVE AVENUE CRONULLA REDEVELOPMENT

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

- Council is undertaking the development of the Cronulla Town Centre Public Domain Master Plan (which was the subject of a separate report - refer INF001-18). These works will be staged with the upgrade of Ocean Grove Avenue, Cronulla being the first stage (Stage 1).
- Ocean Grove Avenue works are being undertaken at the same time as the frontage works for the former Commonwealth Bank building at No. 66 Cronulla Street.
- A detailed design has been completed by Council’s design section with specialist work commissioned to consultants; insufficient time remains to conduct a formal tender as well as completing the works within the required time-frame.
- Council has received a price from a contractor as well as estimates from Quantity Surveyors and Council’s Civil Operations Unit.

COMMITTEE RECOMMENDATION

THAT:
1. The report for Ocean Grove Avenue Redevelopment be received and noted.
2. Council’s Civil Operations be appointed as the Principal Contractor with Project Services being appointed as Project Managers and works proceed as indicated in the report.
EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

- This application was referred to the Independent Hearing and Assessment Panel (IHAP) because the application was called up by Councillors Forshaw, Provan and Simone.
- The application is for demolition of existing structures, construction of a multi dwelling housing development comprising 4 dwellings including basement car parking and two swimming pools.
- The site is located on the southern side of Actinotus Avenue. The site is 1 lot that currently comprises a dwelling house and ancillary structures.

COMMITTEE RECOMMENDATION

That Development Application No. 17/0135 for demolition of existing structures, construction of a multi dwelling housing development containing 4 dwellings including basement car parking and two swimming pools at Lot 132 DP 5606 26 Actinotus Avenue, Caringbah South be received and noted.
EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

- Pre-development application discussions (Pre-DAs) are a service provided to residents of the Shire seeking to develop their land.
- Pre-DAs seek to improve the quality of development outcomes by providing initial feedback to residents regarding development opportunities and constraints.
- In new residential areas (subdivisions) and more sensitive environmental locations, a Pre-DA discussion can reduce application angst, provide clarity of development controls and more effectively resolve development issues.
- It is recommended that the Pre-DA service be expanded to include single dwelling houses, with a nominal $100 fee applicable.

COMMITTEE RECOMMENDATION

THAT:

1. The pre-development application service provided by Council be expanded to encompass single dwelling houses, and a nominal $100 fee be charged for this service.

2. The proposed fee for pre-development application service (single dwelling houses) be advertised for 28 days in accordance with section 610F of the Local Government Act 1993.

3. After the completion of the 28 day advertisement period, a report be provided to council on any submissions received and seeking the formal adoption of the fee for inclusion in Council's 2017/2018 Schedule of Fees and Charges.
EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

- This report provides a progress update in response to Council Resolution BWN009-17 which requested specific information about buildings in the Sutherland Shire with Aluminium Composite Panel (ACP) cladding.
- In response to the London Grenfell Residential Tower catastrophe, Council staff have undertaken an audit of buildings and found that 15 residential buildings over 3 stories or aged care buildings that have ACP cladding.
- Following consultation with Councils through LGNSW, the NSW Government made a decision to take the lead role in addressing this issue in the interest of a swift, consistent response across Sydney. Sutherland Shire Council will assist and supplement the NSW Government's initiatives, and no further action needs to be initiated by Council at this stage.
- The Minister for Innovation & Better Regulation released a 10 point plan that includes a number of initiatives, including writing to the building / strata manager or owners of buildings with ACP cladding to encourage them to inspect and test their cladding, and having FRNSW visit each affected building.

COMMITTEE RECOMMENDATION

THAT:

1. Council continue to work collaboratively with the NSW Government and Local Government NSW to address potential safety risks associated with the use of aluminium composite panels in higher risk classes of building.
2. An update be provided to Councillors via the Councillor Bulletin.
3. The NSW Fire and Rescue be invited to provide information at a Councillor Briefing regarding their current fire appliances.
EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

- In 2006 the NSW Government introduced a comprehensive framework known as Planning for Bushfire Protection. The framework provides development standards for subdivision of land and buildings in bushfire prone areas in NSW.
- A number of amendments are proposed and the Rural Fire Service recently placed revised documents on exhibition inviting submissions (Appendix A).
- The proposed amendments are generally considered positive, however, there are a few areas where improvements could be made.
- Council planning officers reviewed the amendments and made a submission (Appendix B). The submission is reported to Council for review so that Council can make a supplementary submission if there are any additional issues it would like to raise.

COMMITTEE RECOMMENDATION

That this report and the submission made to the Rural Fire Service on the proposed amendments to Planning for Bushfire Protection be endorsed and noted.
SER003-18 PROPOSED SALE OF LAND - 45B LANGER AVE, CARINGBAH SOUTH

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

- Council owns Lot 14 DP1218946 located at 45B Langer Avenue, Caringbah South, a drainage reserve classified as operational land, with a R2 Low Density Residential zoning.
- The 223m² reserve contains no Council infrastructure and there is no future requirement for Council to drain water over the land and it is surplus to Council's requirements.
- Two adjoining owners have expressed interest in purchasing the land.
- It is proposed that the land be sold by way of expression of interest.

COMMITTEE RECOMMENDATION

THAT:

1. An expression of interest process be undertaken for the sale of Lot 14 DP1218946 located at 45B Langer Avenue, Caringbah South.

2. Contract/s for sale be executed on terms and conditions deemed satisfactory by the General Manager.

3. Subject to point 1, in accordance with the Power of Attorney dated 6 July 2016 BK 4710 No. 28, the General Manager execute any necessary documentation to give effect to this resolution.
SER004-18  RELEASE OF EASEMENT AT 5 WOODFORD CRESCENT, HEATHCOTE

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

- The registered owner of 5 Woodford Crescent, Heathcote has requested the release of two (2) easements for drainage that benefit Council located on Lot 2 DP 21242.
- Council's stormwater system bypassed these easements some years ago and any stormwater infrastructure and associated easements are now redundant.
- An independent valuer has been engaged to determine the compensation payable to Council taking the Release and Relocation Policy into consideration.
- The release of the existing drainage easement allows the owner of the property to build permanent structures over the top of the easements, subject to Council Planning approvals.

COMMITTEE RECOMMENDATION

THAT:

1. Two (2) redundant easements for Service (Drainage) be expunged over private land described as 5 Woodford Crescent Heathcote (Lot 2 DP 212425) at terms and conditions to the satisfaction of the General Manager.

2. In accordance with the Power of Attorney dated 6 July 2016 BK 4710 No. 28, the General Manager execute any necessary documentation to give effect to these resolutions.
EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

- Council currently has several Grants and Subsidies programs, Community Grants, Arts and Cultural Grants, Venue Hire Subsidies and other recurrent subsidies. In 2018/19 and onwards, these grant and subsidy programs, and all associated funding allocations, will be combined into one annual program.
- Applications will open in March each year, for the next financial year. If adopted, the first grant application period will open in March 2018. Current recipients will be invited to apply and assistance offered to current and new applicants concerning the new application process via information sessions.
- Guidelines that inform and assist potential applicants have been prepared and its outcomes align to Council’s Community Strategic Plan.
- To ensure continuity of existing community, arts and cultural programs during the transition period, groups currently supported via the Arts and Cultural Subsidy Program and Hall Hire Subsidy should continue to receive support.

COMMITTEE RECOMMENDATION

THAT:

1. The combined ‘Annual Community Grants and Subsidies Program’ be adopted by Council and the first round of Grant applications commence in March 2018.
2. Support for the current 2017/18 Arts and Cultural Subsidy Program providing $79,739 of assistance to 23 programs be continued during the transition period to the new Annual Community Grants and Subsidies Program.
3. Support for the current 2017/18 Community Halls Venue Hire Subsidies providing $94,464 of assistance to 15 community groups be continued during the transition period to the new Annual Community Grants and Subsidies Program.
EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

- Meetings of the Sutherland Traffic and Traffic Safety Committee and Consultative Traffic Forum were held on 01 September 2017.
- The Minutes of the meetings are below.

REPORT RECOMMENDATION

THAT:

1. The decisions contained in the Minutes of the Sutherland Traffic and Traffic Safety Committee Meeting held on 01 September 2017 be noted.

2. The recommendations contained in the Minutes of the Consultative Traffic Forum Meeting held on 01 September 2017 be adopted.
PRESENT: Councillor Croucher (Chairperson), and Councillor McLean together with Mr Tony Blain (representing Lee Evans MP), Ms Michelle Lawson (representing Mark Speakman MP), Senior Constable Michael Todd (representing the NSW Police, Miranda Local Area Command), Senior Constable Rachel King (representing the NSW Police, Sutherland Local Area Command), Ms Tanmila Islam (representing Roads and Maritime Services), Mr Nick Kokoski (representing Roads and Maritime Services), Mr Michael Cutrupi (representing St George Cabs), Acting Traffic and Transport Manager (Peter Warren), Senior Traffic Engineer (Bruce Powe), Traffic Engineer (Cristian Vasquez), Executive Officer - Governance (Neil Treadwell).

APOLOGY: Apologies tendered on behalf of Eleni Petinos MP, Lee Evans MP, Mark Speakman MP and Mr Rabih Bekdache (STA) were accepted.

Report and Minutes of the Meeting of the Sutherland Traffic and Traffic Safety Committee held on Friday, 01 September 2017

DECISION: (T Blain / Cr Croucher)
That the Report and Minutes of the Sutherland Traffic and Traffic Safety Committee Meeting held on Friday, 4 August 2017 be confirmed as a correct record, subject to the following comment being added to the Late Matters Raised at Meeting, that;
"In regard to the timed parking restrictions being introduced at the Sutherland Leisure Centre car park, that vehicle registration details (post code only) be checked to determine the patronage of the Sutherland Leisure Centre."

*** Disclosures of Interest

Councillor Croucher declared a not significant non-pecuniary interest in the following matter:

STR022-18 Holt Road, West of Venetia St, Sylvania - Pedestrian Refuge Island
File Number: 2017/263071

advising that he is a member of the Sutherland Primary School school council and raised this matter on their behalf with the Traffic Unit.

All Report Recommendations were voted unanimously by the Sutherland Traffic and Traffic Safety Committee.
DECISION:

THAT:

1. The "Bus Zone" outside No.522-528 be repositioned to a location outside Nos.514-520 President Avenue, Sutherland, in accordance with Plan 'A' attached to the report.

2. The Authorised Officers be advised of this decision for enforcement purposes.

DECISION:

THAT:

1. The provision of an oval threshold and two mini-roundabouts along Saunders Bay Road, Caringbah South, in accordance with Plan 'A' attached to the report be endorsed in principle by the Committee.

2. The above work be further scoped, costed and listed for consideration for inclusion in a future Traffic and Transport Works Program.
*** Councillor Croucher declared a not significant non-pecuniary interest in the following matter:

DECISION:

That subsequent to discussions between the RMS and Council, a report be provided to the October meeting of the Sutherland Traffic and Traffic Safety Committee with preferred design options.

STR023-18  Minor Signage and Linemarking - September 2017
File Number: 2017/263071

DECISION:

THAT:

1. The recommendations listed in the Minor Signage Items table, be approved in accordance with the attached Plans.

2. (i) In regard to Plan W2, that Plan W2 be adopted, with the following amendments:
   a. Provision of a 'TB' Holding Line at the T leg of the intersection.
   b. Removal of the No Parking restrictions.
   (ii) The changes noted above are implemented in accordance with ‘Amended Plan W2’ attached to the minutes marked Appendix A.

3. In regard to Plan C8, that this matter be deferred to the October meeting.

4. The Authorised Officers be advised of this decision for enforcement purposes.
ADDITIONAL REPORTS

STR024-18  Alfords Point Road, Menai Road and Old Illawarra Road, Menai - Queing Issues.
File Number: 2017/263071

DECISION:
That staff provide previous correspondence from Council to the RMS about queing in Alfords Point Road, Menai Road and Old Illawarra Road, Menai to the Member for Heathcote’s representative, so that the Member for Heathcote can make representations to the relevant authorities about the queing problems.

STR025-18  Intersection of Kingsway, Port Hacking Road South and Mackay Street, Caringbah
File Number: 2016/231313

DECISION:
THAT;
1. Council acknowledge the suggested changes proposed by the Sutherland Traffic and Traffic Safety Committee at the intersection of Kingsway, Port Hacking Road South and Mackay Street, Caringbah.
2. The suggested changes be referred to the Traffic and Transport Unit for consideration and feedback.

LATE MATTERS RAISED AT MEETING

Mr Michael Cutrupi (representing St George Cabs) raised the issue of the proposed RMS change in location of the taxi 'lay over' area in Hay Avenue, Caringbah and advised there were no objections to the proposed relocation site.

Report and Minutes of the Meeting of the Consultative Traffic Forum held on Friday, 01 September 2017

DECISION:  (T Blain/Cr Croucher)
That the Report and Minutes of the Consultative Traffic Forum Meeting held on Friday, 4 August 2017 be confirmed as a correct record.
Disclosures of Interest

There were no disclosures of interest declared.

CTF005-18  Pinnacle Street, Miranda - Streetscape Concept Design
            File Number: 2017/263071

RECOMMENDATION:

That the Consultative Traffic Forum support the provision of a Shared Zone at Pinnacle Street, Miranda, in accordance with Plan 'A' and Plan 'B' attached to the report, subject to further detail designs being provided to a future meeting of the Sutherland Traffic and Traffic Safety Committee.

LATE MATTERS RAISED AT MEETING

Councillor McLean raised issues regarding parking issues around St. John Bosco School at Engadine. The issues will be discussed further with the Senior Traffic Engineer.

The Meeting closed at 10.40 am.

RESPONSIBLE OFFICER

The officer responsible for the preparation of this Report is the Acting Traffic & Transport Services Manager, Peter Warren, who can be contacted on 9710 0576.

File Number: 2015/2036
**PRICES CIRCUIT at PRICES CIRCUIT, WORONORA**

**PROPOSED ‘NO STOPPING’ SIGNS and ‘GIVE WAY’ LINE**

*Install ‘No Stopping’ sign, next to driveway, approximately 18m from side street, as shown.*

*Paint TB “Give Way” line at intersection up to midpoint of Prices Cct, as shown. Line to be 0.5m behind a kerbface projected through the intersection.*

*Caution against use of yellow ‘No Stopping’ lines as it could result in having to paint 200 metres up Prices Circuit to the end of the dividing (barrier) line.*
EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

- On Tuesday 25 July 2017 Council introduced a six month trial of a "No Left Turn" restriction into Cronulla Street at the southern end of the Cronulla retail centre opposite Cronulla Railway Station.
- Council at its meeting on 21 August 2017 resolved to receive a report on the progress of the trial including consultation with businesses.
- This report provides information regarding the operation of the trial including community feedback.
- It is recommended that insufficient time has passed to evaluate the trial and it should continue for the planned six month period.

REPORT RECOMMENDATION

THAT:

1. The Preliminary Report on the six month trial of 'No Left Turn' into Cronulla Street be received and noted.

2. The trial continue under close supervision of Council.

3. Improved advance warning and direction signposting be provided to assist motorists to understand the new way to enter the retail centre from Cronulla Street.

4. A report be provided to Council at the conclusion of the trial outlining the impacts of the changed traffic movement.
PURPOSE
To provide preliminary information on the impacts of the trial 'no left turn' movement into Cronulla Street in accordance with Council's resolution at its meeting of 21 August 2017 (see BWN001-18).

BACKGROUND
The Cronulla Town Centre Traffic Study - July 2015 was reported to Council in August 2015 and included an emphasis on improving traffic flow at the pinch point on Cronulla Street at Cronulla Railway Station.

Council has regularly received concerns regarding delays and queuing for southbound vehicles at this location. The delays are mostly attributable to the following:

- Insufficient capacity at the mid-block pedestrian traffic signals outside Cronulla Station, and;
- The left turn movement into the one way section of Cronulla Street queuing out into the southbound through traffic stream.

On 25 July 2017 Council introduced a six month trial of a "No Left Turn" restriction into Cronulla Street at the southern end of the Cronulla retail centre opposite Cronulla Railway Station (STR118-17). This outcome arose following a community and stakeholder workshop in February 2017 and consultation with the Cronulla Chamber of Commerce. A plan of the approved restriction is contained in 'Appendix A'.

Shortly following the commencement of the trial concerns were raised by some local businesses at the southern end of the retail centre stating that the restriction has resulted in significant loss of trade. A petition from businesses was tabled by Councillor Simone at Council's meeting of 21 August 2017 calling for the immediate removal of the no left turn restriction. In response to those concerns Council, at the September Ordinary Meeting, resolved that:

1. Council receive a report from officers setting out the preliminary results of the trial 'no left turn' from Croydon Street into Cronulla Street, Cronulla.

2. The report shall include, but not be limited to, an analysis of the impact of the changed traffic condition on local businesses after consulting with affected business owners on their opinion of the impact and any alternative solutions they consider acceptable.

DISCUSSION
It is relevant to note that the intended purpose of the trial is to improve southbound traffic flow on the western side of the retail centre adjacent the railway line. As with any change there are foreseen and potentially unforeseen trade-offs/consequences that need to be taken into account.

The following actions have been undertaken to measure the effectiveness of the trial to date.
• Before and after traffic and parking surveys;
• Before and after site observations and video surveillance;
• Survey of affected businesses; and
• Analysis of unsolicited feedback.

Traffic and Parking Surveys

i) Traffic volumes

‘Appendix ‘B’ attached to this report provides a before and after comparison of turning movements at the intersection of Croydon Street and Cronulla Street (location of no left turn) during the AM and PM weekday and Saturday peak periods.

The counts indicate that there has been an overall reduction in peak traffic volumes of approximately 40% in the retail centre (Shared Zone) section of Cronulla Street following the introduction of the no left turn movement.

In this regard, it is worth noting that surveys undertaken prior to the no left turn indicated that approximately 60% of traffic turning into Cronulla Street was circulating without finding a parking space.

ii) Pedestrian volumes

‘Appendix ‘C’ attached to this report provides a before and after comparison of pedestrian movements in Cronulla Street during the AM and PM weekday and Saturday peak periods.

The counts indicate that there are approximately 14% more pedestrians using the retail centre section of Cronulla Street in August 2017 compared with October 2014.

iii) Parking Occupancy

Before and after weekday and parking occupancy surveys were undertaken in the one way sections of Cronulla Street, Surf Road and Purley Place where there is a total of 85 time-limited, on street car parking spaces. The number of occupied parking spaces was recorded at half hour intervals over a period of nine hours. The results of the surveys can be summarised as follows:

• Following the introduction of the no left turn movement, the average occupancy rate of all car parking spaces in the survey area reduced from 98% to 94% on a typical weekday between 9am and 6pm.
• Following the introduction of the no left turn movement, the average occupancy rate of all car parking spaces in the survey area reduced from 98% to 94% on a typical Saturday between 9am and 6pm.
Expert analysis indicates that the optimal occupancy rate for on street parking is between 85% and 90%. This allows motorists entering the area to be reasonably confident of obtaining a parking space and avoid unnecessary circulation of vehicles attempting to find a parking space which contributes to town centre traffic congestion. Occupancy rates above 90% will still promote congestion due to lack of available spaces for vehicles seeking a space.

In this regard, traffic surveys undertaken prior to the no left turn restriction indicated that approximately 60% of vehicles were circulating through the retail centre without obtaining a parking space. The resulting traffic congestion was not only impacting on traffic flows through the centre but also causing considerable delay to traffic travelling to South Cronulla.

**Site Observations**

Site observations indicate that southbound traffic flows have improved in both the AM and PM peak periods. In particular the PM peak period is flowing much better. Reports from some residents is this has been well received by southbound motorists.

However, whilst the left turn restriction has been effective in eliminating congestion due to vehicles queuing out of the retail centre, there remains an underlying capacity issue at the signalised pedestrian crossing at the station during peak weekend periods. Significant southbound queuing was reported and witnessed during periods of warmer weather of a Saturday and Sunday.

**Business Surveys**

In accordance with Council's resolution, Council officers undertook a survey questionnaire of affected businesses in Cronulla Street, Surf Road and Purley Place with regard to their opinion of the impact of the no left turn trial to date. The results of the questionnaire are summarised below.

It should also be noted that some unsolicited responses were received by businesses prior to the survey and have been included in the resulting summary.

- A total of 54 businesses completed the survey.
- 39% of respondents indicated that there was a very noticeable reduction in customers visiting their shop. A further 16% indicated a slightly noticeable reduction in customers. 39% indicated no change with 6% indicating a slight increase in customers.
- 34% of respondents indicated that there was a very noticeable reduction in takings compared to the same period last year. A further 27% indicated a slightly noticeable reduction in sales. 21% indicated no change and 4% indicated a slight increase. 14% of respondents were unable to answer the question.

Based on retailer feedback it is apparent that many genuinely perceive that the reduced traffic volumes have negatively impacted their businesses. Anecdotally some businesses have indicated an approximate reduction of 15 to 20% of turnover in comparison to the month preceding the introduction
of the trial or same period as last year. This was particularly so for the cafe and clothing type businesses and less so for the produce and service type businesses. However, no businesses were able to provide quantifiable data to support these figures. Concerns were more pronounced towards the southern end of the centre. Businesses north of Purley Place seemed far less affected given they are closer to the Croydon Street car park. Other businesses reported that whilst they have not identified any change in revenue, they have received feedback from customers that the changed traffic movement was inconvenient.

Whilst individual retailers figures cannot be verified by Council they are contrary to the results of the parking and pedestrian surveys. In this regard, there was the suggestion from some proprietors that as a result of the improved parking availability combined with the inconvenience of the no left turn there has been a change in the dynamic of customers using the parking. For example there are more planned visitations rather than passing trips which may benefit some businesses while disadvantaging others.

There was also the suggestion that the reduction in circulating traffic means that less people are likely to venture to the southern end of the street as there is less "buzz". However, the before and after pedestrian counts undertaken in 2014 and 2017 do not support this.

Unsolicited feedback
Fourteen unsolicited written responses have been received by Council including the following:

- A petition with 49 signatures from local businesses calling for the immediate removal of the no left restriction turn due to loss of trade.
- A letter from the Cronulla Chamber of Commerce

With regard to the petition, it should be noted that when contacted directly some business proprietors indicated that they had felt an obligation to sign the petition to support the petitioner but that it did not accurately reflect their position/situation.

The letter from the Cronulla Chamber of Commerce notes that there has been a mixed reaction to the no left turn restrictions from the businesses which they represent. The Chamber has suggested Council provide the following:

- Continuation of the trial;
- Better advanced warning and directional sign posting advising motorists of the new way to enter Cronulla Street; and
- Monitoring of traffic volumes entering the southern end of the centre.
The other twelve responses were various and are summarised in the following table.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>No. of Responses</th>
<th>Comment/Issue</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>Request immediate removal of no left turn restriction due to loss of trade</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>No left turn has made a big improvement to southbound traffic flow</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>Doesn't support the loss of 15 minute parking at taxi rank</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>Supports no left turn restriction but concerned with loss of 15 minute parking at taxi rank</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>Concerned with safety of new arrangement</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>Concerned with safety and queuing at intersection of Laycock Avenue.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>Concerned with queuing at intersection of Laycock Avenue.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**ALTERNATIVES**

An information session and workshop was conducted at Cronulla community centre in February 2017 to explore alternative traffic congestion solutions. Local stakeholders representing business, services and the broader community were invited to attend the information session and workshop. Twenty-eight stakeholders attended the workshop and information session including members of the local business community. Four Councillors and four Council staff also attended. The workshop and information session format included:

- Presentation by Council on traffic circulation issues in the Cronulla town centre.
- Presentation of the pros and cons, opportunities and trade-offs of a range of solutions to address traffic circulation issues in the town centre.
- Small group work to discuss the pros and cons, and provide feedback, on the options presented.
- Round table discussion to share additional ideas to address traffic flow issues in Cronulla Town Centre.

The option of restricting the left turn movement and permitting only right turn movements into the southern end of the centre received majority support.

Notwithstanding and despite the initial success of the no left turn restriction with respect to traffic flow, it is considered that for the longer term, additional improvement measures will still be required to cater for traffic growth in the area.

Preliminary investigation has been undertaken with regard to the following options which are often suggested by the community:

**One way loop via Gerrale Street, Laycock Avenue and Wilbar Avenue.**

Initial analysis indicates that this is not a viable option given the confluence of opposing traffic flows in the vicinity of Wilbar Avenue, Croydon Street and Searl Road.
**Tonkin Street Route**

Whilst traffic modelling indicates that the connection of Tonkin Street through to Seal Road will provide the required additional capacity, there are a number of significant issues associated with this proposal which require further investigation with regard to feasibility including:

- Use of the rail corridor and impact on the existing rail embankment;
- Relocation of the primary sewer and water mains servicing South Cronulla;
- Impact on Tonkin Oval;
- Land acquisition and reconfiguration of the intersection of Waratah Street and Nicholson Parade; and
- Loss of parking.

**Grade Separated Pedestrian Crossing**

Having a grade separated crossing to the railway station would significantly reduce traffic delays. However, there would be cost and feasibility issues associated with this option. The cost of this proposal would be very significant and a feasibility study for this option would need to demonstrate outstanding improvements to traffic flow.

It is identified that existing pedestrian signals, by default, assist in regulating the right turn movement into one way section of Cronulla Street during peak periods. It is likely that traffic signals would still be required to regulate this movement.

**BUDGET AND RESOURCES**

The implementation and evaluation of the six month trial is being funded in Council's current 2017/18 budget.

**POLICY**

The current decision of the Sutherland Traffic and Traffic Safety Committee and subsequent resolution of Council states that the no left turn restrictions be provided on a six month trial basis.

**CONCLUSION OF THE TRIAL**

The trial is timed to be completed on 25 January 2018, however the report on the trial will be to the Council meeting on 19 February 2018. The ‘no left turn’ will need to remain in place until the Council determine the trial on 19 February 2018.

**CONCLUSION**

It is acknowledged that traffic flows and people take time to establish new patterns of behaviour upon the introduction of changed conditions and lack of tolerance for change is often a significant issue. This is particularly so where the change may have some detrimental (perceived or real) impacts. Whilst the concerns of those businesses identifying the impacts are acknowledged the current real or
perceived loss of trade may be the result of a number of contributing factors, including winter weather and therefore cannot necessarily be solely attributed to the traffic changes.

Based on the evidence presented to date it is considered on balance, the trial should continue as originally intended and that a further evaluation and report be provided to Council at the completion of the six month trial period. The benefit of continuing the trial is to see the impact of the warmer months on traffic, parking and customer numbers including further consultation with affected businesses.

RESPONSIBLE OFFICER
The officer responsible for the preparation of this Report is the Acting Traffic and Transport Manager, Peter Warren, who can be contacted on 9710 0576.

File Number: 2017/274081
APPENDIX ‘A’
NO LEFT TURN TO CRONULLA PLAZA, CRONULLA

NO LEFT TURN SIGN ON NEW STEM AS SHOWN

‘TRAVERSABLE FLEXIBLE BOLLARD’ AS SHOWN

LINE MARKING AS SHOWN

EXISTING KEEP CLEAR SIGN & LINE MARKING AS SHOWN
# APPENDIX ‘B’

## Intersection of Croydon and Cronulla Street

Turn Count Before and After No Left Turn Comparison

### AM PEAK

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>PEAK</th>
<th>DATE</th>
<th>LEFT TURN</th>
<th>RIGHT TURN</th>
<th>TOTAL</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>AM</td>
<td>16/10/2014 (Before)</td>
<td>173</td>
<td>70</td>
<td>243</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>AM</td>
<td>20/07/2017 (Before)</td>
<td>128</td>
<td>84</td>
<td>202</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>AM</td>
<td>17/08/2017 (After)</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>160</td>
<td>164</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>AM</td>
<td>7/09/2017 (After)</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>149</td>
<td>151</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### PM PEAK

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>PEAK</th>
<th>DATE</th>
<th>LEFT TURN</th>
<th>RIGHT TURN</th>
<th>TOTAL</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>PM</td>
<td>16/10/2014 (Before)</td>
<td>198</td>
<td>83</td>
<td>281</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PM</td>
<td>20/07/2017 (Before)</td>
<td>228</td>
<td>107</td>
<td>335</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PM</td>
<td>17/08/2017 (After)</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>184</td>
<td>187</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PM</td>
<td>7/09/2017 (After)</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>160</td>
<td>161</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### SATURDAY

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>PEAK</th>
<th>DATE</th>
<th>LEFT TURN</th>
<th>RIGHT TURN</th>
<th>TOTAL</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>SAT</td>
<td>18/10/2014 (Before)</td>
<td>204</td>
<td>91</td>
<td>295</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SAT</td>
<td>22/07/2017 (Before)</td>
<td>192</td>
<td>96</td>
<td>288</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SAT</td>
<td>19/08/2017 (After)</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>164</td>
<td>168</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SAT</td>
<td>26/08/2017 (After)</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>169</td>
<td>172</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>DATE</td>
<td>Pedestrians per Hour</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>---------------------</td>
<td>----------------------</td>
<td>--</td>
<td>--</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>A</td>
<td>B</td>
<td>C</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>AM PEAK</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>October 2014 (Before)</td>
<td>113</td>
<td>321</td>
<td>30</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>August 2017 (After)</td>
<td>127</td>
<td>321</td>
<td>46</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PM PEAK</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>October 2014 (Before)</td>
<td>149</td>
<td>528</td>
<td>62</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>August 2017 (After)</td>
<td>165</td>
<td>571</td>
<td>62</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SATURDAY</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>October 2014 (Before)</td>
<td>228</td>
<td>1028</td>
<td>125</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>August 2017 (After)</td>
<td>272</td>
<td>1195</td>
<td>177</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Pursuant to Notice, Councillor Plibersek submitted the following Motion:

THAT:

Council write to the Minister for Planning seeking an exemption from the application of the provisions of the Environmental Planning and Assessment Act 1979 and Electoral Legislation Amendment (Planning Panels and Enforcement) Act 2017 that provide that an IHAP or a local planning panel or council staff are the determining authority for development applications having a value less than $30 million. Council requests that the elected Council maintain the ability to call up and determine any development application having a value less than $30 million if in the opinion of an elected Councillor, it is in the community’s interest to do so.

File Number: 2015/4841
Pursuant to Notice, Councillor Simpson submitted the following Motion:

THAT:
1. A working party be established to explore the feasibility of energy generation within the Sutherland Shire to reduce Council’s exposure to energy price increases.
2. Councillors who are interested in sitting on the working party express their interest to participate to the General Manager by 29 September 2017.
3. The first working party meeting shall receive advice on the cost of and resources required to prepare a preliminary feasibility study which explores all reasonable options to reduce energy prices.

File Number: 2017/285225
CONFIDENTIAL REPORTS OF THE SHIRE SERVICES COMMITTEE HELD ON 4 SEPTEMBER 2017

In accordance with Section 10A(1) of Local Government Act 1993, the following matters will be considered in the Closed Session:

SER002A-18 PROPOSED SUBLEASE OF SSHED LEASE AT 1 PITT STREET, LOFTUS

Section 10A(2)(c) Information that would, if Disclosed, Confer a Commercial Advantage on a Person with Whom the Council is Conducting (or Proposes to Conduct) Business: This matter is being considered in Closed session as it relates to the entering into of a contract where prior knowledge of the proposal could confer an unfair financial advantage on any person.