PLANNING STUDY

Analysis of retail supermarket floor space in the Sutherland Local Government Area

For:
Fabcot Pty Ltd

Submitted to:
Sutherland Shire Council

Date:
February 2017

2015.0037 Planning Study
Copyright:
The copyright in this work is vested in Higgins Planning and the document is issued in confidence for the purpose only for which it is supplied to the client, it has been prepared with all reasonable skill, care and diligence, and taking into account the timescale and resources allocated to it by agreement with the client. Information herein is based on the interpretation of data collected, which has been accepted in good faith as being accurate and valid. It must not be reproduced in whole or in part except under an agreement with, or with the consent in writing of, Higgins Planning and then only on the condition that this notice appears in any such reproduction. No warranties or guarantees are expressed or should be inferred by any third parties. This report may not be relied upon by other parties without the written consent of Higgins Planning. No information as to the contents or subject matter of this document or any part thereof may be given orally or in writing or communicated in any manner whatsoever to any third party without prior consent in writing of Higgins Planning. Higgins Planning disclaims any responsibility to the client and others in respect of any matters outside the agreed scope of the work.
# TABLE OF CONTENTS

1. **INTRODUCTION** .................................................................................................................. 1
   1.1 OVERVIEW ....................................................................................................................... 1
   1.2 STUDY AREA .................................................................................................................... 4
   1.3 STUDY OBJECTIVES ........................................................................................................ 4
   1.4 STUDY METHODOLOGY ............................................................................................... 5
   1.5 REPORT STRUCTURE OVERVIEW .............................................................................. 5

2. **STRATEGIC PLANNING FRAMEWORK AND DOCUMENTS** ...................................... 7
   2.1 A PLAN FOR GROWING SYDNEY ................................................................................ 7
      2.1.1 A Vision for Sydney ................................................................................................. 7
      2.1.2 Direction 1.9: Support Priority Economic Sectors ............................................. 11
   2.2 TOWARDS OUR GREATER SYDNEY 2056 .................................................................. 14
   2.3 DRAFT SOUTH DISTRICT PLAN – NOVEMBER 2016 ............................................... 16
   2.4 LONG TERM TRANSPORT MASTER PLAN AND REBUILDING NSW - STATE INFRASTRUCTURE STRATEGY 2014 ................................................................. 20
   2.5 SUTHERLAND LOCAL ENVIRONMENTAL PLAN 2015 ......................................... 20

3. **RETAIL TRENDS AND CHANGES IN TECHNOLOGY** .................................................. 26
   3.1 RETAIL TRENDS ........................................................................................................... 26
   3.2 CHANGES IN TECHNOLOGY INFLUENCING RETAILING ....................................... 29
      3.2.1 Internet / Online Retailing ....................................................................................... 29
      3.2.2 Online Retail Sales Snapshot - April 2015 compared to April 2016 ................. 30
      3.2.3 World’s Best Practice in Supermarket Online Retailing ...................................... 31
      3.2.4 Australian Retailers and online retailing ............................................................. 32
      3.2.5 Woolworths Online Retailing Experience .......................................................... 35

4. **ANALYSIS OF SUPERMARKET FLOOR SPACE IN SUTHERLAND LGA** ............... 38
4.1 WOOLWORTHS LAND AREA REQUIREMENTS FOR RETAIL SUPERMARKETS AND LAND USE SURVEYS .................................................................................................................. 38

4.1.1 Woolworths Land Area Requirements for Retail Supermarkets........ 38

4.1.2 Land Use Surveys .................................................................................. 38

4.2 SITES PREVIOUSLY PROPOSED BY WOOLWORTHS .................................................. 51

4.2.1 Development Application at Barden Ridge ........................................... 51

4.2.2 Planning Proposal at Barden Ridge........................................................... 52

4.2.3 Development Application at Kirrawee....................................................... 52

4.3 WOOLWORTHS VOICE OF THE CUSTOMER .................................................. 52

4.4 RESIDENTS SURVEY BY CROSBY TEXTOR ................................................. 54

4.5 SUTHERLAND LGA – SUPERMARKET AND CONSUMER TRENDS JULY 2016 BY MACROPLAN DIMASI .......................................................................................... 55

4.6 SUTHERLAND LGA SUPERMARKET ANALYSIS AND TAREN POINT DEEP-DIVE BY QUANTIUM.......................................................................................... 58

5. WOOLWORTHS RESPONSE TO THE NEED FOR NEW SUPERMARKET FLOOR SPACE IN THE SUTHERLAND LGA AND THE GROWTH OF ONLINE RETAILING........... 60

5.1 BACKGROUND ............................................................................................. 60

5.2 WOOLWORTHS STRATEGY ......................................................................... 61

5.3 FREIGHT AND LOGISTICS ......................................................................... 61

6. CONCLUSION ................................................................................................. 63
APPENDICES

Appendix A: Land Use Surveys

Appendix B: “Ward C Survey” December 2016 by Crosby Textor

Appendix C: “Sutherland LGA Supermarket and consumer trends review” by MacroPlan Dimasi July 2016 including “Sutherland LGA analysis and Taren Point deep-dive” April 2016 by Quantum
LIST OF FIGURES

Figure 1: Sutherland LGA

Figure 2: Extract of Figure 4: A Plan for Growing Sydney – connecting jobs and homes

Figure 3: Extract of Figure 20: Southern Sydney

Figure 4: Extract of “Figure 2 A metropolis of three cities: Global Sydney”

Figure 5: Extract of Figure 26 Sydney’s Six Subregions - South Region

Figure 6: Extract of “Figure 3-7 Strategic district and local centre – draft South District Plan”

Figure 7: Value of internet commerce in Australia, 2003-04 to 2009-10

Figure 8: Employed persons by industry, Sydney, 2001 and 2011

LIST OF TABLES

Table 1: Summary of JRPP approvals in Caringbah B3

Table 2: Woolworths Voice of the Customer Responses Summary for Miranda, Sylvania and Caringbah
LIST OF PHOTOGRAPHS

Photo 1: View of existing site development at 130 Parraweena Road.

Photo 2: View of existing building and loading dock at 130 Parraweena Road.

Photo 3: View of existing site development at 142 Parraweena Road.

Photo 4: View of existing site development at 142 Parraweena Road.

Photo 5: View of existing building at corner of Parraweena Road with Kareena Road.

Photo 6: View of existing loading dock accessed from Kareena Road to building at 142 Parraweena Road.

Photo 7: View of existing site frontage to Parraweena Road looking east.

Photo 8: View of existing site frontage to Parraweena Road looking west.
GLOSSARY OF ABBREVIATIONS

Australian Bureau of Statistics (ABS)
Development Control Plan (DCP)
Economic Impact Assessment (EIA)
Floor space Ratio (FSR)
Greater Metropolitan Area (GMA)
Greater Sydney Commission (GSC)
Gross Floor Area (GFA)
Gross Lettable Area (GLA)
Local Environmental Plan (LEP)
Local Government Area (LGA)
NSW Department of Planning and Environment (DP&E)
Social Impact Assessment (SIA)
Sydney Metropolitan Area (SMA)
1. INTRODUCTION

1.1 OVERVIEW

This Planning Study report (Planning Study) has been prepared to analyse retail supermarket floor space within the Sutherland Local Government Area (LGA) and identify a potential location where new retail supermarket floor space can be supported while at the same time facilitate Woolworths “multi-option retailing” model.

This Planning Study been prepared on behalf of Fabcot Pty Ltd (Fabcot). Fabcot is a wholly owned subsidiary of Woolworths Limited (Woolworths) within Woolworths Corporate Property.

Woolworths makes a significant contribution to economic development and employment across New South Wales (NSW). Woolworths as a whole employed in 2016 a National workforce of over 198,000 people across the country.


Woolworths is one of NSW’s largest employers, with over 52,000 staff employed in stores including supermarkets, BIG Ws, petrol sites, Dan Murphy’s, BWS liquor outlets and hotels. Woolworths continues to grow by over 7,000 employees a year.

Woolworths ability to invest in NSW, service the needs of a growing population and provide jobs, is heavily dependent on the capacity of planning, zoning and the development approval frameworks to facilitate new retail infrastructure investment. For many years, the NSW planning process has been identified by Woolworths as the most costly and onerous in the country.

Woolworths has been exploring and seeking opportunities to locate new supermarkets within the Sutherland Shire LGA (Sutherland LGA) for an extended period of time. Woolworths through their own internal commercial in confidence evaluations have identified an “undersupply” of supermarket floor space within the Sutherland LGA over a number of years.

This undersupply has been confirmed in the work by MacroPlan Dimasi in comparing the existing amount of retail supermarket floor space to the National and the Sydney averages as detailed in the report titled “Sutherland LGA – Supermarket and consumer trends review July 2016”. The work specifically involved:

- Undertaking an analysis of supermarket floor space provision per capita in the Sutherland LGA, including comparisons with metropolitan Sydney, NSW and Australia. This has involved examining the provision of supermarket floor space across the broader “South District” (i.e. one of the NSW DPE metro strategy sub-regions) and assesses the trading performance of local supermarkets within the Sutherland LGA;
- Undertaking a further analysis of retail employment trends within the Sutherland LGA; and
Providing a summary of economic and community impacts associated with any identified under-supply of supermarket floor space for local residents.

The work by MacroPlan Dimasi is included at Appendix C and summarised in Section 4.4 of this Planning Study.

Woolworths has had discussions with Sutherland Shire Council (Council) and other owners of land with a view to source suitable locations for new and expanded Woolworths supermarkets, including exploration of co-location opportunities over a number of years within the Sutherland LGA.

For a number of reasons, no existing suitably zoned parcels of land are currently available or due to size and fragmented ownership, a number of sites within existing centres have been ruled out by Woolworths as being suitable to locate a new supermarket in the Sutherland LGA. This has been confirmed by MacroPlan Dimasi who has undertaken an evaluation of a number of parcels of land within Miranda and Caringbah as to their suitability for new supermarket retail floor space as part of a sequential test, refer to Section 4.4 of this report.

In addition, Woolworths Corporate Property team, have been tasked within finding new ways to innovate in support of a number of Woolworths’ business objectives, in particular, finding ways to support Woolworths’ “multi-option retailing” associated with Woolworths supermarkets:

**Multi-option Retail**

It’s the beginning of an era for the new Woolworths’ Multi-Option team. They operate in a fast paced, nimble environment with entrepreneurial-minded professionals who work collaboratively to be the leaders in the market. Our point of difference is that we are a part of Australia’s largest retailer allowing us to provide unparalleled career opportunities. The group is positioned to drive innovation across the business and has a unique perspective where we see all aspects of how we provide excellent customer experiences.


“Multi-option retailing” is in part, Woolworths’ response to the growth in online retailing which is forcing traditional retailing to diversify. Customers are no longer solely relying on traditional “brick and mortar” locations to be the only source to undertake their shopping.

Woolworths has been forced to adapt, and is changing the nature of how it fulfils its customers’ requirements and has moved to implement a hybrid retail model (which includes online retailing with brick-and-mortar retailing) in the right locations in Sydney including southern Sydney, which places greater emphasis on the way Woolworths distributes goods to its customers from a base facility.

To fulfil these online customer requirements, some new Woolworths supermarkets will need to facilitate “multi-option retailing” by including a “warehousing and distribution” function within purpose built buildings. In addition, these need to be positioned in accessible locations similar to warehousing and distribution facilities within employment areas throughout the Sydney metropolitan area.
Woolworths “multi-option retailing” model includes a “click and collect” function where a customer places an order online and collects that order from a brick-and-mortar store at a designated collection point which may not be within the trading floor of a supermarket.

In addition, the “multi-option retailing” model includes an “online fulfilment” function where a customer can place an order online but chooses the home delivery of that order which is managed by staff on-site, who pick and package that order. This is the component of the model which is the warehousing and distribution function. The distribution of these orders is managed by a fleet of small Woolworths trucks.

If the proposal progresses to the Development Application (DA) stage, Woolworths will be seeking standard operating hours. There will be no truck movements outside of these hours, however there may be staff in the building so as the online fulfilment function can be undertaken, and orders prepared ready for delivery to meet a customer’s expectation for the delivery time.

Woolworths “multi-option retailing” is their response to market demand in diversifying to include a warehousing and distribution function to provide customers with greater choice in either seeking access to viewing the product themselves prior to purchase, customers being provided with convenient access, or due to time poor lifestyles providing the delivery of goods at home.

All of these functions are best suited to employment area locations where: access is convenient; traffic movements demonstrate trips are already generated by destination or through movements; already generate jobs or are seeking renewed activities to generate jobs; and are in close proximity to the major arterial road networks.

The evolution of some of Woolworths supermarket facilities requires “built in” capacity to support the existing “dark box” which Woolworths implemented in Mascot in 2014. The “dark box” is a warehouse and distribution centre to enable products to be processed in significant volumes and in a timely manner to meet online fulfilment orders only. Woolworths staff pick the customer online fulfilment order and facilitate its distribution. Woolworths has advised that the growth in online fulfilment orders of 27% year on year, has meant that the “dark box” is now approaching capacity and the need to find support locations throughout Sydney is increasing. Therefore, locations in high demand areas are being sourced to provide support to the “dark box”. This support for the “dark box” is akin to a “hub and spoke” of a wheel, where the “dark box” is the “hub” and a number of “spokes” are being provided in more accessible employment land locations throughout metropolitan Sydney.

“Evidenced based planning” was commenced by the NSW Department of Planning and Environment, and subsequently by the Greater Sydney Commission now underpin strategic planning to support the actions and directions of “A Plan for Growing Sydney”. The Greater Sydney Commission has commenced the exhibition of draft District Plans for all the Sydney regions, this has included a draft District Plan for the South Region taking in all of the land contained within the Sutherland LGA. In this plan, Taren Point is designated a “local centre”.

2015.0037 3
1.2 STUDY AREA

This study relates to the whole of the Sutherland LGA as identified in Figure 1 below.

Figure 1: Sutherland LGA (outlined in red)

1.3 STUDY OBJECTIVES

The objectives of this study are:

1. To determine if there continues to be an undersupply of retail supermarket floor space in the Sutherland LGA given the information and research prepared in 2010 by Hill PDA;

2. To identify any issue/s with accommodating additional retail supermarket floor space within existing centres in the Sutherland LGA; and

3. To consider a suitable location for new retail supermarket floor space.
1.4 STUDY METHODOLOGY

This study is based on the following methodology:

1. Desktop Review of available source information, including:
   a. Various websites;
   b. Articles published in Journals and Newspapers;
2. Inspections of parcels of land and sites, throughout the LGA;
3. Research from existing reports;
4. Preparation of supporting studies;
5. Engagement with local residents; and
6. Consultation with Council.

This Planning Study is supported by surveys, research and analysis, including:

- Land Use Surveys for Taren Point and Caringbah – Appendix A;
- Ward C Survey community research by Crosby Textor – Appendix B; and
- “Sutherland LGA Supermarket and Consumer Trends review” by MacroPlan Dimasi with “Sutherland LGA supermarket analysis and Taren Point deep-dive” by Quantium – Appendix C.

1.5 REPORT STRUCTURE OVERVIEW

This structure of this report can be summarized, as follows:

- Chapter 1 – includes an introduction to the study area, the study objectives and study methodology;
- Chapter 2 – provides an overview of the current strategic planning framework affecting retail outcomes in Sydney and the Sutherland Local Government Area (LGA), in particular a focus on how the framework contributes to retail economic outcomes and supports the digital economy;
- Chapter 3 – provides an overview and analysis of what customers want in their retail environments as a result of retail trends, the influence of the digital economy;
• Chapter 4 – includes information about the requirements of a Woolworths supermarket and its similarities to “warehousing and distribution” uses in industrial zones as a result of keeping pace with customer needs as a result of the growth of the digital economy and an analysis of supermarket retail floor space supply in the Sutherland LGA, in which it is concluded that the location of a site within the Taren Point Employment Area is more suitable;

• Chapter 5 – provides Woolworths respond to these changes demanded by customers and providing an increased supply of retail supermarket floor space in the Taren Point Employment Area; and

• Chapter 6 – provides conclusions.
2. STRATEGIC PLANNING FRAMEWORK AND DOCUMENTS

This section of the study summarises the existing strategic planning framework and documents strategic planning policy information affecting the supply of retail supermarket floor space within Sutherland LGA. In addition, this section of the study seeks to identify whether there are any specific actions or directions which promote the realisation of new retail supermarket floor space within the Sutherland LGA.

2.1 A PLAN FOR GROWING SYDNEY

In December 2014, NSW Government released A Plan for Growing Sydney (referred throughout this report as ‘The Plan’). The Sydney metropolitan area is facing increased pressure (over the next twenty years) with a projected increase in population of 1.6 million people, requiring 664,000 more dwellings and 689,000 more jobs by 2031. These pressures require careful and integrated land use and infrastructure planning and mechanisms for delivery. The Plan is the NSW Government’s response to these pressures. The Plan provides a strategy for accommodating Sydney’s future population growth over the next 20 years and a framework for delivering investment and jobs growth.

2.1.1 A Vision for Sydney

The Government’s Vision for Sydney is a Strong Global City and A Great Place to Live.

The Government’s vision for Sydney is proposed to be achieved by:

THE PLAN

The Government’s vision for Sydney is: a strong global city, a great place to live.

To achieve this vision, the Government has set down goals that Sydney will be:

- a competitive economy with world-class services and transport;
- a city of housing choice with homes that meet our needs and lifestyles;
- a great place to live with communities that are strong, healthy and well connected; and
- a sustainable and resilient city that protects the natural environment and has a balanced approach to the use of land and resources.

(Refer to pages 2 & 5)

The Plan aims to better connect people to strategic centres and in doing so, connecting them to jobs, education facilities, health centres and hospitals and sporting, cultural and entertainment facilities. The Plan identifies growth projections from a whole of Sydney perspective, and seeks to:

SYDNEY IS AN ICONIC GLOBAL CITY AND IT IS GROWING

... Sydney needs a plan that outlines how to:

- make it easier for Sydney’s residents to move between their homes, their jobs, the centres where they shop and use local services, and their open spaces;
• make a wider variety of housing available to suit the changing make-up of the population - more than one million people will be over the age of 65 years and almost the same number under the age of 15 years by 2031;
• deliver new infrastructure which supports our community as it grows, and strategic infrastructure that also strengthens the economy; and
• recognise our highly prized environment - the harbour, the coast, our mountains, parks and open spaces – and how to safeguard these places.

A Plan for Growing Sydney is the Government’s plan to achieve these things. It’s an action plan focused on bringing all stakeholders together with a common purpose – to develop a competitive economy with world-class services and transport; to deliver greater housing choice to meet our changing needs and lifestyles; to create communities that have a strong sense of wellbeing; and to safeguard our natural environment.

Planning where people will live and work across Sydney, and how these places are connected to each other, will influence Sydney’s long-term success and the standard of living our communities will enjoy. It is critical not to repeat the mistakes of the past – dispersed housing growth that resulted in a sprawling and poorly connected city, complicated by unique geographic constraints. Planning for Sydney’s inevitable population growth has never been more important.

**Figure 2** as follows demonstrates the location of strategic centres throughout the Sydney Metropolitan Area (SMA).

With respect to Goal 1 it is noted that the Sutherland LGA does not contain any “strategic centres” as identified under The Plan. Strategic centres have been identified in The Plan as shown in the extract below of **Figure 2** “Strategic Plan for the future growth of Sydney”:
Figure 2: Extract of Figure 4: A Plan for Growing Sydney – connecting jobs and homes – with strategic centres identified by “orange circles”.

Source: A Plan for Growing Sydney
To achieve Goal 1 the Plan includes a number of directions and actions, and in particular the “Directions and Actions” associated with goal 1 states in part:

... 

**GOAL 1: A Competitive Economy with World-Class Services and Transport**

The Plan will support Sydney being a premier location for global commerce, business and investment. Sydney CBD is the focal point for Australian finance and home to the Australian Stock Exchange - the eleventh largest in the world. By 2031, Sydney will be a more productive and prosperous city, with strong ties to its region and with world-class infrastructure that supports growing, efficient and innovative industries.

Expanding the Sydney CBD will allow the city to continue to compete on the world stage as the Australian hub for global trade and commerce. A well connected second CBD in Greater Parramatta will increase our national and metropolitan reach. The arc of intensive economic activity stretching across the Global Economic Corridor, from Port Botany and Sydney Airport to Macquarie Park, will be extended to Parramatta, Norwest and Sydney Olympic Park. This will continue to strengthen economic growth. There will be new opportunities for business to invest. Badgerys Creek Airport will emerge as a new hub of intense economic activity and improved new transport connections will enable centres such as Liverpool, Penrith and Campbelltown- Macarthur to continue to grow as regional city centres.

**DIRECTIONS AND ACTIONS**

... 

**Support Priority Economic Sectors**

- Support the growth of priority industries with appropriate planning controls.
- Support key industrial precincts with appropriate planning controls.

While it is noted that no strategic centres have been nominated under A Plan for Growing Sydney in the Sutherland LGA, this does not preclude the concept of growing an existing centre or even the creation of centres within existing urbanised areas as not all growth may be possible in existing strategic centres or other centres. This is acknowledged within A Plan for Growing Sydney associated with priority economic sectors. More details about priority economic sectors are discussed in The Plan which will be discussed at Section 2.1.2 below.

Woolworths as part of the private sector seeks to make an active contribute as a stakeholder, which The Plan recognises at pages 18 and 19 as important in understanding and working together in the delivery of actions and directions. Woolworths has approached Sutherland Shire Council and would like to make a contribution to shaping strategic planning while it is being prepared rather than having to respond to a plan once created and placed on exhibition. Woolworths understand that the district plan is currently being prepared and it is hoped that the undersupply of retail supermarket floor space within the Sutherland LGA is recognised as an issue which planning controls should address.
2.1.2 Direction 1.9: Support Priority Economic Sectors

As mentioned above, “priority economic sectors” have been recognised as an important element of The Plan, and Direction 1.9 specifically states:

**DIRECTION 1.9: SUPPORT PRIORITY ECONOMIC SECTORS**

The growth of priority industries has to be supported by planning for their land use needs. Benefits can flow from the emergence of industry clusters in cost-effective locations.

The Government is progressively developing Industry Action Plans as part of NSW 2021 including for the following priority industries:

- visitor economy (tourism);
- creative industries;
- digital economy (such as information and communications technology);
- professional services;
- manufacturing;
- minerals;
- international education and research; and
- agriculture.

A Plan for Growing Sydney will create a setting for sufficient well-located and well-serviced land to be available to meet the needs of these industries.

As detailed in Section 3.2 of this Planning Study, online retailing is a significant component influencing Woolworths responses to customer requirements. The “digital economy” as listed above is a priority economic sector and one which Woolworths multi-option retailing model has embraced. Woolworths is encouraged that planning strategies such as The Plan seek to implement planning frameworks to support these activities.

In addition, The Plan does not preclude a wider role and function to assist with delivering outcomes for the digital economy associated with employment or industrial lands as highlighted by **Action 1.9.2: Support Key Industrial Precinct with Appropriate Planning Controls** below:

**ACTION 1.9.2: SUPPORT KEY INDUSTRIAL PRECINCTS WITH APPROPRIATE PLANNING CONTROLS**

The Industrial Lands Strategic Assessment Checklist will guide the assessment of proposed rezonings of industrial lands. It poses questions about whether the site is near or within direct access to key economic infrastructure, how it contributes to a significant industry cluster, and how the proposed rezoning would impact on industrial land stocks and employment objectives in each subregion. The Checklist allows for evidence-based decisions and aims to prevent encroachment on important industrial sites.

The Government will:

- undertake an analysis of Sydney’s stock of industrial zoned land to identify key industrial precincts and use the findings to:
  - determine where improved planning controls are required to better protect industrial land from conversion to other uses;
• identify where improved and innovative planning controls will allow for
the ongoing evolution of industrial activities to more intensive
commercial activities; and
• update the Industrial Lands Strategic Assessment Checklist.

• assess new proposals to convert existing industrial zoned land to other uses
under the Industrial Lands Strategic Assessment Checklist.

The delivery of development outcomes in industrial areas or employment areas in Sydney to
support the growth of Sydney is a goal of The Plan and includes a number of actions. Specifically,
Action 1.11.1: Preserve Future Transport and Road Corridors to Support Future Growth and Figure
3, as detailed below, highlights that preservation of future transport and road infrastructure
corridors are required to support growth including:

**ACTION 1.11.1: PRESERVE FUTURE TRANSPORT AND ROAD CORRIDORS TO SUPPORT FUTURE GROWTH**

Preserving future transport corridors allows Sydney’s transport networks to grow as the city’s
population grows. They become a focus for future housing and jobs and link residents to other
services and recreation.

*Work has commenced on developing a Corridor Strategy for the Sydney Rapid Transit to preserve the
corridor for the rail line and identify opportunities to maximise the delivery of jobs closer to homes
and homes closer to jobs.*
It is noted that The Plan includes in Figure 20 (as extracted above) the A6 Road / F6 Motorway corridor extension being preserved and subject to further investigation. This is also highlighted in Sections 2.2 and 2.4 of this Planning Study below.
2.2 TOWARDS OUR GREATER SYDNEY 2056

In November 2016, the Greater Sydney Commission (GSC) released a draft amendment to A Plan for Growing Sydney (the Greater Sydney Regional Plan) for public exhibition known as Towards Our Greater Sydney 2056. It should be noted that the draft District Plans use A Plan for Growing Sydney as its base, they also draw on the “new vision” for Greater Sydney as articulated in Towards Our Greater Sydney 2056.

Towards Our Greater Sydney 2056 is the Greater Sydney Regional Plan amendment prepared by the GSC which proposes a new “Three Cities” structure, or polycentric city model, for Greater Sydney including: the established Eastern City (Sydney City); the developing Central City (Greater Parramatta); and the emerging Western City focused around the proposed Western Sydney Airport, as shown in the extract below.

![Figure 4: Extract of “Figure 2 A metropolis of three cities: Global Sydney”](image)

Source: Towards our Greater Sydney 2056
Towards Our Greater Sydney 2056 (Sydney 2056) is a draft 40-year vision underpinning each of the draft District Plans. It presents a shift away from thinking of Sydney anchored by a single central business district. Sydney 2056 is an update of A Plan for Growing Sydney.

Towards Our Greater Sydney 2056 identifies three cities and embeds the notion of a ‘30 minute’ city. Underpinning the strategic vision for each of the six districts is a metropolitan wide objective for Sydney to be a productive, liveable and sustainable city.

These objectives are derived from the four goals of A Plan for Growing Sydney which are further evolved in Sydney 2056:

“A Productive Sydney”

- A growing city
- A city with smart jobs
- A 30-minute city

“A Liveable Sydney”

- An equitable, polycentric city
- A city of housing choice and diversity
- A collaborative city

“A Sustainable Sydney”

- A city in its landscape
- An efficient city
- A resilient city

Towards Our Greater Sydney 2056 places an emphasis on growing existing centres and allowing new centres to grow.

...Our vision for Greater Sydney to 2056 represents the economic, social and environmental integration of a metropolis of three cities. It acknowledges that Greater Sydney is more likely to develop in a sustainable manner when it has a strong, productive economy underpinning a fair and liveable lifestyle and allowing a focus on Greater Sydney’s natural environment, resilience and efficiency.

Towards Our Greater Sydney 2056 as an amendment to A Plan for Growing Sydney, does not at this time, replace the legal status of A Plan for Growing Sydney as the current regional plan.
2.3 DRAFT SOUTH DISTRICT PLAN – NOVEMBER 2016

As part of A Plan for Growing Sydney, the NSW Government established the independent Greater Sydney Commission, which has been working in partnership with councils, the community and stakeholders to oversee the implementation of the plan.

The Greater Sydney metropolitan area has six subregions, now referred to as districts, and focuses on strategy and what’s needed in neighbourhoods, the region and the three cities.

A Plan for Growing Sydney advises in relation to the subregional plans:

- **Subregional planning** is a partnership between State Government, local councils and the community. It will guide the delivery of A Plan for Growing Sydney across the city’s six subregions. Each plan will address:
  - a vision for housing and employment growth in the subregion, consistent with A Plan for Growing Sydney;
  - the distribution of housing and employment at the Local Government Area level;
  - the goals, directions and actions contained within A Plan for Growing Sydney; and
  - the infrastructure required to support housing and employment growth within the subregion.

The draft District Plans give effect to the metropolitan goals and planning priorities from A Plan for Growing Sydney and the Greater Sydney Regional Plan amendment Towards our Greater Sydney 2056 by setting out priorities and actions for each District, structured around three key themes of a Productive City, a Liveable City and a Sustainable City.

The draft District Plans provide a series of priorities across all districts as well as key district only priorities and actions, which have been summarized as follows across all districts:

**Productivity**
- Recognise a Centre Hierarchy of Strategic, District and Local Centres
- Reinforce and promote office and retail activity in strategic centres and some district centres (via B3 zones)
- Provide 20 year Job targets for Strategic and District centres
- Identify health and education super precincts that create significant opportunity to drive economic activity
- Manage employment and urban services land by taking a precautionary approach to conversion of that land and to step away from the previous industrial lands checklist in A Plan for Growing Sydney
- Recognise the importance of freight access and movement
- Discourage urban development in the Metropolitan rural land

**Liveability**
- Provide 5 year housing targets for councils
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>District</th>
<th>Population 2036</th>
<th>5 year housing target</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Central</td>
<td>1,338,000</td>
<td>46,550</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>North</td>
<td>1,083,000</td>
<td>25,950</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>South</td>
<td>945,350</td>
<td>23,250</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>South West</td>
<td>1,088,000</td>
<td>31,450</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>West</td>
<td>446,300</td>
<td>8,400</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>West Central</td>
<td>1,521,000</td>
<td>53,500</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

- Provide 20 year District housing targets (as detailed above)
- Require Councils to undertake Housing Studies to inform the 20 year targets
- Introduce affordable rental housing at a rate of 5 -10% to apply to land within new urban renewal or land release areas identified via a local or district housing strategy
- Increase social housing provision
- Support innovative school planning and provision

**Sustainability**

- Deliver a ‘Green Grid’ of open space for Sydney
- Manage a ‘Blue Grid’ of waterways and catchments to support biodiversity
- Plan a resource efficient and resilient city

**Collaboration areas**

- Identify Collaboration Areas where a significant productivity, liveability or sustainability outcome is achieved through the collaboration of different levels of government and the private sector

**Value sharing**

- Recognise the need for value sharing mechanisms that are equitable while also being efficient in terms of their operation and compliance
- Identify the need for a consistent approach to capturing value for public benefit, complementary with other existing mechanisms

Sutherland LGA is part of the South subregion, which also includes the LGAs of Canterbury-Bankstown, Georges River Council (former Hurstville and Kogarah) and Bayside Council (former Rockdale and Botany Council’s) as illustrated in Figure 5 below.
The draft District Plans including the draft South District Plan, provides the link between the Metropolitan Regional Plan (A Plan for Growing Sydney and the recently released for exhibition Towards a Greater Sydney) and Council’s Local Environmental Plans. The draft District Plans seek to influence how different levels of government plan for each District and guide the assessment and decision making process for future development in Sydney. The draft South District Plan (released for exhibition in November 2016) is an intermediate step in translating the Metropolitan Regional Plan at a local level and acts as a broad framework for the long-term development of the South District, guiding government investment and linking local and state planning issues.

The draft South District Plan establishes:
- Principles and guidance for the preparation of local environmental plans;
- Strategic planning criteria to assess planning proposals;
- Strategic land use, transport and infrastructure planning across local government areas; and
- Infrastructure delivery priorities.

The *draft South District Plan* is a matter for consideration in the assessment of development applications and planning proposals, as such has been considered as part of this PP.

A number of centres, including Taren Point, are identified within the Sutherland LGA as shown in figure 3-7 of the draft South District Plan, as extracted below:

*Figure 6: Extract of “Figure 3-7 Strategic district and local centre – draft South District Plan”*

*Source: Draft South District Plan*
2.4 LONG TERM TRANSPORT MASTER PLAN AND REBUILDING NSW - STATE INFRASTRUCTURE STRATEGY 2014

The Long Term Transport Master Plan and Rebuilding NSW – State Infrastructure Strategy 2014 (Infrastructure Strategy) was prepared to support the strategic planning framework being prepared by the State Government and includes elements which supports A Plan for Growing Sydney, including some work associated with preserving and investigating new infrastructure targeted within the Sutherland LGA:

Rebuilding NSW

State Infrastructure Strategy 2014

NSW Government Response

The NSW Government has reviewed the investment recommendations put forward by Infrastructure NSW, and accepts the recommendations, as summarised below. The design and delivery of all projects for which funding is reserved will be subject to thorough examination and scrutiny.

Urban Roads

Complete investigations for large-scale investment in the F6 and A6 corridors.

Gateway to the South

The Government is committed to enhancing a Gateway to the South. The Government has commissioned scoping studies for large scale investment options on the F6 and A6 corridors, which are yet to be finalised. In the interim, in addition to funding the southern extension of WestConnex, the Government will commit $300 million to address pinch points across the A1, A3 and A6 corridors.

No announcement has been made by the State Government concerning the extension of the F6 and A6 Corridors, however the reservation for this potential road infrastructure is shown on the Sutherland Local Environmental Plan 2015 zoning maps.

2.5 SUTHERLAND LOCAL ENVIRONMENTAL PLAN 2015

The main Environmental Planning Instrument (EPI) which affects the site is the Sutherland Local Environmental Plan 2015 (SLEP 2015).

This Planning Study does not proposed to retrace the history of the development and exhibitions of the draft Sutherland LEP 2013 to its gazettal as the SLEP 2015 on 23 June 2015, however a number of submission responses prepared and considered by Council at its meetings in 2014 and 2015 shed light of strategic planning considerations associated with the Taren Point Employment Area and the role and function of the Sutherland-Kirrawee centres, (for completeness the information quoted below has been extracted in-full from the Council report).

The following information provides an insight into the strategic planning and actions of Council in relation to Miranda, Caringbah, Sutherland-Kirrawee existing centres and the Taren Point employment area.
Caringbah and Miranda

Council commenced steps in late 2012 and early 2013 to reshape the role and function of its centres at Miranda, Caringbah and Sutherland-Kirrawee. Council at its meeting held on 12 November 2012 considered a report to nominate Miranda and Caringbah as “Urban activation precincts”.

The report considered by Council further recognises that the retail function of Miranda outweighs that of Caringbah:

As part of the preparation of the SILEP council has also endorsed its Employment Strategy - 2031.

... The retail functions of Caringbah cannot compete with Westfield Miranda and it needs to develop a new economic base.

... The strategic direction for Caringbah centre builds on this idea and couples it with changes to development controls to facilitate redevelopment for quality units above new retail and commercial space.

... The planned revitalisation of Caringbah and the integration of the hospitals into the centre as a catalyst for economic growth, fits the criteria for an Urban Activation Precinct. However, it is relatively small in scope and it is considered that Council would have more likelihood of success if a larger precinct was put forward.

If a longer term strategic view of Sutherland Shire is taken, it is likely that at some point in time the F6 reservation will be utilised. When this occurs it is likely that it will include some form of public transport, even if this is limited to a priority bus service. Even if this was not included, a freeway would free up capacity on Taren Point Road and The Kingsway allowing a priority bus services to be introduced. Although it is acknowledged that the F6 is not a government priority at present, there is a likelihood that increased road and commuting capacity will eventuate in the future which will be of particular benefit to both Caringbah and Miranda.

Council resolved to nominate to DP&E that Caringbah and Miranda should become urban activation precincts. Caringbah and Miranda were not accepted by the State Government and we are advised that Council has not undertaken any specific master planning or strategic planning since this report for Caringbah and Miranda was prepared. Council has supported a number of site specific planning proposals in the Caringbah and Miranda localities, however the Sutherland LEP 2015 was generally a like for like conversion of the former environmental planning instrument.

Sutherland-Kirrawee

Council at its meeting held on 11 March 2013 considered a report on nominating a combined Sutherland-Kirrawee-Loftus area also as an urban activation precinct.

Council considered a report on 12 November 2012 (DAP024-13) which outlined the State Government’s new Urban Activation Precincts program. This report explored the potential of an area focused on the Caringbah and Miranda centres as an urban activation precinct under the NSW State Government Urban Activation Precinct program. On consideration of this report, council resolved to also nominate Caringbah, Miranda and Sutherland for the Urban Activation Precincts program.
The report to council detailed the development concept and scope of the Miranda-Caringbah initiative and this has been conveyed to the Department of Planning and Infrastructure (DP & I). Further analysis was needed to form a development concept to support council’s decision to also nominate Sutherland as an Urban Activation Precinct.

Sutherland Centre currently has relatively limited potential for growth. It is essentially ringed by Strata Title residential flat buildings and the core area is constrained by small lot sizes and viable existing businesses. The potential for growth has been fully explored in the Housing Strategy, but the extent falls short of that envisaged by the Urban Activation Program. However, if Sutherland is considered in a wider context, it takes on greater strategic potential.

Council endorsed that the future role and function of the Sutherland-Kirrawee precinct should allow for change and growth.

Council also considered a number of submissions to the exhibited Draft Sutherland Local Environmental Plan No.3, which included a stated positions in relation to the Kirrawee centre, and the Taren Point Employment Area. The Council responses to these submissions can be summarised in relation to Taren Point as follows:

**Taren Point Employment Area**

Council has acknowledged that the role and function of the Taren Point Employment Area has merit in its expanded retail functions for land to the west of Taren Point Road, however there is a flooding constraint. Council has acknowledged with further master planning would be required to consider solutions to this constraint (for completeness much of the Council report is extracted below):

...During the first and second LEP exhibitions Council received a number of submissions from or on behalf of properties owners on the west side of Taren Point Road seeking to be rezoned from IN1 General Industrial to B5 Business Development to allow bulky goods premises on their sites.

It was considered that if these sites were developed together, there is the potential to solve the constraints to access and flooding, while improving the streetscape for Taren Point Road. However, if the sites are simply rezoned B5 Business Development without being amalgamated and redeveloped, it is highly likely that the existing building will become bulky goods retailing outlets. This would only exacerbate poor existing vehicle movement patterns and maintain the low standard of presentation into the long term.

Consequently it was considered that the best long term option for delivering a quality streetscape and landscaped context to this part of Taren Point Road remains as adopted in Mayoral Minute No.6/13-14 (July 2013):

“That the landowners of the subject properties on the west side of Taren Point Road be advised that the potential for bulky goods has merit, provided that all properties [94-98 Parraweena Road, and 173, 175, 177, 181-187, 189 and 191-193 Taren Point Road] can be included in a single redevelopment which adequately addressed the flooding constraints, provides for the safe movement of vehicles and presents a quality streetscape and landscaped context to Taren Point Road. Should the landowners be able to achieve these outcomes, a planning proposal and master plan should be submitted to reconsider the zoning of the land”.
The Independent Review recommended that:

78. Council should also give consideration to its decision in relation to 94-98 Parraweena Road and 173, 175, 177, 181-187, 189 and 191-193 Taren Point Road to specify the essential outcomes required to prompt a rezoning rather than the means of achieving the outcomes, and

79. Council should reverse its decision to allow bulky goods retail at 100-104 Parraweena Road, Taren Point.

It is noted that Council resolved to permit bulky goods premises at 100-104 Parraweena Rd.

The Review supports the thrust of the officer’s previous conclusions in relation to making bulky goods permissible on 94-98 Parraweena Road and 173, 175, 177, 181-187, 189 and 191-193 Taren Point Road. However, it notes that there may be other ways to achieve the desired outcomes without the need for all sites to be included in a single development. It may be that a solution can be found which would allow the sites to be developed incrementally so that a single development is not required. For example a Voluntary Planning Agreement could come up with a solution for flooding and access that would facilitate the incremental development of the subject lots. The current standard of development along much of Taren Point Road creates a very poor entrance to Sutherland Shire. It is considered that the community benefits of a coordinated approach to this land are worth the wait. In the interim it is considered that the existing zoning should be retained.

108 Parraweena Road

With respect to the request for a B5 Business Development zoning for 108 Parraweena Rd, it is noted that development in the locality is mixed. The subject land is zoned Zone 11 - Employment. The area is proposed to be zoned IN1 General Industrial. Council records indicate that the subject site is affected by flooding. Council has recently approved on the subject site a three storey building containing a childcare centre, recreation facility (gym) and food shop. Flood risk in 108 Parraweena Road is characterised as 'medium' and the proposal adequately addressed flooding issues.

To the east of the site, No.106, Council has approved a new industrial building. To the west, No.110, Council has approved a Construction of a childcare centre for 80 children and Indoor play centre (DA12/0711). Adjacent to 110, at no. 120 is a timber and hardware supplies warehouse, and further west other industrial uses. To the rear is a Tynan car storage/facility.
Aerial Photo – 108 Parraweena Road outlined in red

An IGA supermarket is located directly opposite the site along Parraweena Road. East of IGA is a mix of uses, including BCF (Boating/Camping/Fishing – bulky goods approved under existing use rights), Taren Point Hotel, Beacon Lighting and a Shell service station. Westwards of IGA is a low density residential area.

It is noted that Council resolved to add a provision to the draft plan to enable bulky goods premises at 104 Parraweena Rd (Cronulla Furniture).

The B5 zone has largely been restricted to the eastern side of Taren Point Road. The B5 Business Development zone is a specialised zone which provides for a mix of business, warehouse uses and specialised retail uses principally bulky goods retailing. It is important that the B5 zone only allow activities that do not detract from existing centres, so as to maintain the retail hierarchy in the Shire.

It is clear that the area has a mixed character and is not purely an industrial zone. As discussed above applying the B5 zone to the western side of Taren Point Road is problematic given flooding and access considerations. Furthermore, the adjacent site has been approved as a new industrial building. Applying a B5 zone to one site without a review of the strategic context is not supported. It is considered that a B5 Business Development zoning may be appropriate for the area as a whole (including those properties fronting Taren Point Road), provided that flooding and access issues can be overcome. Until such time as there is a more strategic review to properly inform any decision, it is recommended that the zoning remain IN1 General Industrial.

Response to Issues

The submissions do not raise new issues that warrant a departure from the provisions contained in LEP3.
The Taren Point Employment Area generally west of Taren Point Road, was again considered by Council at its meeting held on 30 November 2015 with respect to “Remaining Minor Amendments – Sutherland Shire Local Environmental Plan 2015 - Amendment 4 Report Number EHR034-16” and “Expansion of the Bulky Goods Precinct, Taren Point” as follows:

...Council officers advised the land owners that the best way to proceed with the development of individual sites is to resolve the design constraints in a masterplan which could be built into the DCP, allowing development to then progress on individual sites. In this way Council, would have certainty that redevelopment would result in good long term planning outcomes and hence support a B5 Business Development zoning. This advice was also forwarded to the land owners in writing the following day.

Following the meeting, one of the main land owners in the precinct (100-104 Parraweeena Road, 189, and 181-178 Taren Point Road) advised in writing that they do not wish to be part of a proposed masterplan for the precinct. Without the cooperation of all land owners it will be difficult to resolve the access and flooding constraints that affect the precinct. This makes it difficult to support a rezoning of the whole precinct to B5 Business Development.

Correspondence has also been received on behalf of the owner of 173-175 Taren Point Road and 94-98 Parraweeena Road. The correspondence seeks Council’s support for a site specific rezoning of this land to Zone B5 Business Development. In support of the rezoning, the submission suggests that assumptions in the Gwawley Bay Catchment Flood Study may result in the study suggesting a greater flooding problem than could exist with better management of the stormwater system. The submission also asserts that the most appropriate stormwater management decisions can be made during the development assessment stage. The submission also highlights that it is proposed to rationalise crossovers to both Taren Point Road and Parraweeena Roads and create a right-of-way to ensure that future co-ordination of access can be achieved.

The Flood Study has made assumptions based on historical flood data and these assumptions are consistent with technical standards endorsed by the Institution of Engineers. The assumptions are also consistent with the assumptions made by other councils. The rationalisation of vehicular access points, largely removes vehicular crossing which are currently redundant and the proposed right-of-way will not benefit the adjacent strata plan.

In considering a rezoning, Council must be satisfied that the rezoning would not have adverse environmental impacts and that the uses is appropriate for the level of risk. A rezoning must demonstrate that it is consistent with local and regional planning strategies and SEPPs. It must demonstrate strategic merit as well as have site specific merit, and be compatible with surrounding land uses. Council must be satisfied that the rezoning proposal will not have adverse environmental impacts, social or economic impacts. Individual spot rezonings generally demonstrate little strategic merit. A spot rezoning will not address the constraints facing the whole precinct. A sensible solution relies on all landowners working together to resolve these. However, should the owner of 173-175 Taren Point Road and 94-98 Parraweeena Road wish to pursue the proposed rezoning, a planning proposal can be prepared and lodged. This will then be subject to a detailed assessment.

The land still has significant development potential. The land is presently zoned IN1 General Industrial and may be developed in accordance with the zone’s permissible uses. Given the reluctance of all land owners to work together, it is recommended that a rezoning to facilitate bulky goods retailing (B5 Business Development zone) not be pursued at this time....

Council has indicated the merit for change in the Taren Point Employment Area, however Council also considers that the flood constraint needs further strategic planning as part of a master plan.
3. RETAIL TRENDS AND CHANGES IN TECHNOLOGY

The main planning framework to guide strategic planning in the Sydney Metropolitan Area has recognised the role of the digital economy. In this regard, it should not be forgotten that the growth of the digital economy reflects customer desires and behaviour. Retail trends and changes in technology have had significant impacts on the way retailing is demanded by customers to be delivered in Australia. The sector has as a result of consumer demand been required to be flexible and adapt swiftly to market changes. These trends, factors and changes are discussed in this chapter.

3.1 RETAIL TRENDS

Population growth, rising real disposable incomes, and innovation and change within the retail industry have underpinned changes which have required retailers in Australia to rapidly adapt.

Population growth and increasing levels of disposable income have provided the means to support new retail development, but it is the innovative nature of the industry itself that has generated major increases in more and sometimes larger centres. The industry’s response to some of these changes has led to the growth and introduction of:

- Indoor shopping centres;
- Convenience shopping; and
- Bulky goods retailing.

Over at least the last 40 years, retailing within Sydney has evolved in response to a number of trends including:

- the regional and ‘super-regional’ centre (such as Westfield) which incorporate a large diversity of shops complemented by leisure activities and other facilities with an extensive trade area;
- ‘convenience community centres’ usually dominated by a supermarket to meet daily and weekly shopping needs;
- ‘stand-alone supermarkets’ offering a just-in-time ‘one stop shop’ such as petrol, video, pharmacy, groceries, fast food, and so on;
- ‘convenience service centres’ being petrol stations on main highways but offering a just-in-time shop with a range of groceries and fast foods including 7 Eleven, Coles Express, Caltex Woolworths, BP Shop, etc;
- Highway service centres;
‘Category killers’ that provide an extensive range and depth of competitively priced merchandise within a single market segment such as Bunnings, Harvey Norman, Freedom, Toys R Us, JB Hi-Fi, etc.

Bulky Goods that integrate warehousing with retailing;

“Power Centres” that incorporate multiple category killers and bulky goods retailers in one large centre;

Factory Outlets.

(Source: Liverpool Retail Centres Hierarchy Review 2012 Hill PDA)

Some of the key retail trends influencing Sutherland LGA include:

• Expansion of one centre with a stronger element of leisure/entertainment activity. The trend towards both larger stores and larger centres in Australia has been evident for decades. This has resulted in the emergence of a “Super regional centre” over 100,000 square metres at Westfield Miranda.

• Continued suburbanisation of office space and the growth of business parks.

• Strong growth in the bulky goods retailing centres with the large format retailers looking to capture market share from the department stores and some specialty retailers in traditional retail centres.

• Growth in the size of supermarket, and market share of the food and beverage household expenditure.

• Growth of mini-majors such as Harris Farm, and category killers such as Pet Barn and JB Hi Fi.

• Reduced share of expenditure captured by traditional department stores.

• Pressure from supermarket and large format retailers to develop outside commercial centres.

• Loss of many traditional speciality retailers but also new retailers entering the market such as ALDI and Costco.

• The emergence and rise in electronic or online retailing.

These trends are due to factors influencing customer behavior:

• *The increase in the proportion of working women*;
• The increase in the proportion of part-time and casual employment and reduction in full-time employment;

• The reduction in the proportion of households that match the traditional family model and an increase in the number of single persons and single parent households;

• The increase disparity of household income, ranging from high double income households to households that rely on welfare;

• The ageing of the population; and

• Increasing working hours for those in full-time employment.

(Source: Liverpool Retail Centres Hierarchy Review 2012 Hill PDA)

A number of these trends have influenced demand for, and location of, commercial office space and therefore also influenced where retailing is occurring across all of the existing employment locations in Sutherland LGA. These changes are placing greater pressure on many of the existing centres in the Sutherland LGA to either adapt, or lose market share, but limited growth of existing centres is due mostly to existing physical constraints. Some locations have adapted and given rise to new locations for shopping such as Cronulla Sharks and the Brick Pit at Kirrawee.

Due to time pressure related management of family activities, such as sporting functions on the weekend, shoppers are seeking access to more conveniently located facilities with more convenient trading hours or seeking to link outings for shopping as part of existing trip activities such as to and from work or sporting activities to accommodate shopping for traditional grocery and clothing offers. In part, the inconvenience of some existing “bricks and mortar” locations and time management pressures, has contributed to the rise of online shopping. Shoppers are increasingly spending more on entertainment, technology and leisure related goods and therefore, shoppers are also seeking a broader range of activities that provide both retail and entertainment options including eating out, wine bars, cinemas and video game parlours.

In addition, the growth of the new economy and ongoing de-industrialisation has strengthened demand for commercial floor space especially in key locations, close to tertiary education and transport links. This trend has seen the emergence of business parks and changes in business composition and technology, with the repurposing and shift in the location of office-based activities outside of traditional centres.

The increase in the number of working hours per household and a greater proportion of dual earning households has resulted in less time for family responsibilities. As a result, work places that enable workers to conveniently combine paid work, leisure and family responsibilities are becoming increasingly attractive (i.e. locations that offer improved access to high quality retail shops and services, a wide range of health, legal, child care, banking and government related outlets, as well as consumer outlets).
3.2 CHANGES IN TECHNOLOGY INFLUENCING RETAILING

3.2.1 Internet / Online Retailing

Internet shopping (also called e-tailing, and electronic retailing, and online retailing) is a retail format in which the retailer and customer communicate with each other through an interactive electronic network. A growing proportion of Australians have access to the internet at home and use mobile devices.

The rate of access has increased significantly in recent years, from 16% of households in 1998 to 79% in December 2014 (Australian Bureau of Statistics (ABS)), and increased by 2% between the periods of December 2014 to December 2015 (ABS).

However, Australia lags behind other western countries with regards to the penetration rate of internet retailing with a market share of 3.9% in 2009. Interestingly, since 2000 up to December 2015, three-quarters of all retail sales growth occurred through online channels, with online channels now accounting for about 8 percent of total retail sales. Three sectors have lagged behind in e-commerce: cars, petrol stations, and groceries. These categories are significant as they are responsible for nearly half of total retail sales and therefore the pool of revenue is close to 16 percent. This has not meant the decline or “death-nell” for bricks-and-mortar stores, rather the steady growth of online sales has generated new potential where existing “bricks-and-mortar” stores need to be able to adapt. (Source: PwC 2015 Retail Trends, Industry Perspectives www.strategyand.pwc.com/perseptives/2015-retail-trends). In 2015, online retail sales grew by 9% to reach $16.6 billion according to the National Australia Bank’s (NAB) Online Retail Sales Index March 2015. Consumer research indicates that the most popular reasons for shopping online are:

- price,
- convenience, and
- greater range.

Conversely, the three main negative points about online shopping are considered to be the lack of immediacy, the lack of opportunity to touch or try on the items, and concerns over fraud. One of the benefits that electronic retailers offer is the opportunity for consumers to search across a broad range of alternatives, develop a smaller set of alternatives based on their needs, and get specific information about the alternatives they want.

Shopper spend on goods online varies across different categories of goods, with the most popular items purchased online being ‘computers, hardware and software’ with a 26% market share, ‘books’ (12% market share), ‘clothes’ (11%) and ‘food and groceries’ (10%).
The most popular .com.au listed websites for online retail sales in 2015 were (www.smartcompany.com.au “Australia’s top 20 online retailers: 2015” March 2015):

1. Tempe & Webster
2. Kogan
3. The Iconic
4. Catch of the Day
5. Booktopia
6. JB Hi-Fi
7. Red Balloon
8. Dan Murphy’s
9. Lorna Jane
10. Shoes of Prey
11. Dick Smith (prior to Kogan purchase)
12. Appliances Online
13. ShowPo
14. Style Runner
15. Pet Circle
16. Adore Beauty
17. OzSale
18. Klika
19. Vinomofo
20. HardToFind

3.2.2 Online Retail Sales Snapshot - April 2015 compared to April 2016

National Australia Bank (NAB) releases month to month information regarding online retailing via their Business Research and Insight Indexes.

The NAB Online Retail Sales Index is based on two million non-cash transactions per day, scaled up to replicate the broad economy, the NAB Online Retail Sales Index tracks online retail spending across sectors, demographics, locations and the breakdown of goods bought from domestic and international online retailers. The index is produced monthly and analysis is provided on a quarterly basis.

The data is collated through Quantum. Quantum is currently Australia’s leading data analytics and strategy firm. Quantum has worked with NAB for more than six years, assessing de-identified transaction data to derive insights, trends and shopping habits of different customer groups. The resulting analysis forms “Market Blueprint” and is used by NAB and other businesses to drive innovation and business performance through customer, distribution and marketing strategies.

Australia’s online retail spending increased to $16.9 billion for the year to April 2015, or by 9.6% annually. At that time in 2015, it represented around 7.0% of traditional retail spending, excluding cafes, restaurants and takeaway food.

Comparable year growth in traditional bricks & mortar retail (was up 5.3% in March 2015) was still outpaced by the improvement in online retail (8.2%). That said, recent online growth has been more subdued than the 20-30% year-on-year growth rates recorded in earlier years. In April the seasonally adjusted month-on-month change was 1.5%. At 0.6%, the trend estimate for online retail sales is unchanged relative to March and February.
Domestic retailers controlled 75.5% of total online spending as of April 2015, relatively unchanged on the previous 3 months. Growth in both international and domestic online retail sales accelerated in April 2015, though domestic online continues to outpace international in year-on-year (yoy) terms.

The April 2016 NAB monthly research published the following summary:

**Online sales increase 0.3% in April 2016**

- At 0.3% the latest seasonally adjusted NAB Online Retail Sales Index shows sales growth weakened in April, after rapid growth in March (1.7%) and February (1.0%). As a result the annual growth rate slowed from 13.0% to 10.8%. The trend estimate for online retail sales also slowed to 0.7% – continuing a weakening trend. Looking through the month to month volatility, it appears that online sales in April were relatively soft – albeit coming off a very strong few months.

- ABS data showed growth of traditional retailers grew in March (0.3% mom, s.a.), and 3.7% higher than a year ago. At 10.8% over the year, growth of online retail continues to significantly outpace traditional retail sales growth.

- In dollar terms, we estimate Australians spent $19.6 billion on online retail in the 12 months to April 2016. This level is equivalent to 6.6% of spending at traditional bricks & mortar retailers as measured by the ABS in the 12 months to March 2016.

- A key driver of the overall result was the slowdown in Homewares and Appliances which contracted slightly (-0.2% year on year (yoy) vs 10.9% yoy in March).

- Sales were also slower in Fashion (8.5% yoy vs 14.0% yoy), Games and Toys (16.2% yoy vs 32.6% yoy), Daily Deals (-8.3% yoy vs -2.9% yoy) and slightly slower in Media (27.3% yoy vs 29.5% yoy).

- Sales improved in Personal and Recreational (7.6% yoy vs 0% yoy), Groceries and Liquor (8% yoy vs 3.4%), Food Catering (47.6% yoy vs 45.8% yoy) and Department and Variety Stores (2.5% yoy vs 1.8% yoy).

*While representing just over a third of all online sales, SME (18.1% yoy) outpaced corporates in March and improved on the March yoy growth (9.2%).*

### 3.2.3 World’s Best Practice in Supermarket Online Retailing

As has been demonstrated by Tesco, the world’s 6th biggest grocer and leader in supermarket retailers, the need for modern retailers to keep pace with the most significant growth market, online retailing, is imperative. Tesco will celebrate 20 years since the launch of its online service in November 2016. Tesco has become the undisputed king of online grocery retailing with revenues of more than £2.5 billion, more than twice the sales of the closest competitor:

*The biggest reasons for the great competitive advantage of Tesco can be found from the way it reacted to the rise of the internet. The patient and active approach enabled them to build a sound long-term vision of what the internet meant for the core business of the company and to what kinds of actions that would require from the company. As a result of the early launch Tesco had already been developing the online service for a couple of years, when the expectations towards the Internet based businesses started to grow.*
To summarise: the proactive approach early on enabled Tesco to gain experience and perspective for the realistic development of the online channel. Coupled with the patient and committed involvement of the top management enabled Tesco to develop the world’s biggest online grocery service with comparatively small investments, at least compared to the companies who invested in big warehouses which were eventually abandoned.

The clarity of the vision for the online channel and its influence on the traditional business gave Tesco the confidence to see above the noise of the dot com boom.

In today’s marketplace the business models resemble the ones seen during the dot com boom, as the retailers have started to construct warehouses and dot com stores. Challenged by Ocado and its highly optimized warehouses, the Tesco model of using stores alongside the dot com stores (warehouses) remains a solid approach.

(Source: Retailinsider.com/2013/11/tescos-online-grocery-journey.html)

In this regard, Tesco developed a model now referred to as a “the dotcom store” in 2011. The “dot com store” is the location where freight and logistics bring convenience goods from the distribution centre to a warehouse variant of a supermarket, so as employees can pick and package internet orders which are subsequently distributed to or collected by customers.


### 3.2.4 Australian Retailers and online retailing

The influence of online retailing in Australia has been at times slow to be taken up in the retail industry. A well-known Australian example is that of Harvey Norman. For an extended period of time, Gerry Harvey indicated to the market that the growth of online retailing was adversely impacting the ability of his business to generate profits, arguing for the Federal Government to tax all goods purchased online. At that time, Harvey Norman did not have any online presence. In 2009, Harvey Norman changed their approach to match their competitors such as JB Hi-fi and The Good Guys by providing customers with the ability to purchase online.

Another example of a business which did not see the initial need to have a presence online was David Jones. This attitude changed at the time of the GFC and the department store retailer changed its strategy to include online retailing to complement its stores.


The Australian Productivity Commission released a report in 2011 titled “Economic Structure and Performance of the Australian Retail Industry”, in which it assisted in defining “internet retailing or online retailing” in “Chapter 4 – Trends and issues related to online retailing” as follows:
Terms such as e-commerce or internet commerce have been developed to describe the process in which electronic transactions facilitate the exchange of, and payment for, goods and services between businesses, consumers, government and other public and private organisations using the internet, computer networks and portable electronic devices. The OECD definition of e-commerce further specifies that it relates to the ordering of goods and services over the internet, but the payment and ultimate delivery of the good or service can be conducted on or offline (ACMA 2010a).

Online retailing is a subset of e-commerce and refers to the purchase and sale of goods between consumers and retailers using the internet — also referred to as the business to consumer (or B2C) market. Other terms are interchanged for online retailing including e-tailing. Online retailing establishments can take the form of 'pure plays' in which businesses provide online only services in particular retail categories or as part of multi-channel establishments where online activities are combined with bricks and mortar operations. (2011, p.4)

The report also demonstrated the significant increase in levels of internet commerce investment occurring in Australia since 2003 (Productivity Commission, 2011).

In addition, this report advised in Chapter 8 “Planning and zoning regulation”:

- **Land use regulation** that centralises retail activity can be either competition-enhancing or competition-reducing, depending on how it is designed and implemented by the relevant planning authorities.
- To minimise the anti-competitive effects of zoning, policy makers need to ensure that areas where retailers locate are both sufficiently large (in terms of total retail floor space) and sufficiently broad (in terms of allowable uses, particularly those relating to business definitions and/or processes) to allow new and innovative firms to enter local markets and existing firms to expand.
A number of overseas studies have examined the impact on the retail industry of some land use regulations that restrict the establishment of new large format stores. These studies suggest that restricting the development of larger stores lowers retail productivity, reduces retail employment and raises consumer prices.

Overseas evidence also suggests that some land use restrictions raise property prices in residential and commercial markets by constraining the quantity (and location) of available space. These empirical results are useful directional proxies for the impact of planning and zoning controls on domestic retail property values.

In its recent benchmarking study on planning, zoning and development assessment, the Commission identified a number of leading practices to support competition. While all these leading practices should be implemented to improve the competitiveness of the retail market, two are of particular importance:

- Governments should broaden and simplify business zoning to remove the need for ad hoc changes to council plans to accommodate each variation in business model.
- Governments should not consider the viability of existing businesses at any stage of planning, rezoning or development assessment. Impacts of possible future retail locations on existing activity centre viability (but not specific businesses) should only be considered during strategic plan preparation or major review. (2011, p. 215)

On 4 June 2013, Roy Morgan Research released a study which advised:

*The number of Australians who shop online has tipped over the 50 per cent mark for the first time.* (2013).

The report titled, “State of the Nation” examined the social trends of 50,000 consumers over the past decade. The report has a special focus on “online retailing” and points to a 12 per cent growth in the sector over 2013. The report further found that in a three month period during 2013, some 50.3 per cent of Australians had shopped online.

The report also indicated that online shopping is becoming increasingly mainstream, and acknowledges the role for traditional retailers to exist alongside online shopping with a view that the retail sector will need to adjust to the market as “retailers who play in both spaces will probably do extremely well”.

“Smart phone” and mobile devices penetration is now running at about 50 per cent of Australians, and this means that people do not need to be home to order online; the emergence of smart phone price-checking and the use of smart phones to explore the availability of goods is now well-documented. The use of smart phones to make online purchases has grown 101 per cent in the past year (Roy Morgan Research, 2013).

In August 2013, NetSuite Inc. sponsored research conducted by Frost & Sullivan which had the support of the Australian Retailers Association, indicating the following:

- Although online sales have grown strongly in recent years, penetration in Australia is still only around 7 per cent of sales, which is behind comparable markets such as the UK and USA where online sales account for around 10 per cent of total retail sales.
Many bricks and mortar retailers are currently missing out on market opportunities. Utilising a multi-channelled approach can offer many opportunities, such as lower operating costs, the ability to reach new customer segments, greater variety and choice of goods with the ability to operate with fewer geographical limitations.

Retailers are increasingly recognising the advantages of multi-channelling and that these experiences are being increasingly demanded by customers (2013).

The ABS also completed a survey in December 2011 titled “8146.0 – Household Use of Information Technology, Australia” which indicated that 73% of households had access to “broadband” and 92% of all households had internet access. This survey also found the proportion of internet users that purchased or ordered goods or services over the internet was 68%, up from 64% in 2008-09.

3.2.5 Woolworths Online Retailing Experience

Woolworths as at September 2015 ranked 17th in the world’s top 20 global grocery retailers by annual sales (RetailWeek 30 September 2015: www.retail-week.com/sectors/grocery/analysis-top-20-global-retailers-by-annual-sales) and this has been maintained since 2013. Source: http://www.smh.com.au/business/the-worlds-top-20-retailers-20130116-2cssw.html

In 1998, Woolworths launched their “HomeShop” business which provides home delivery of groceries. In 2008, Woolworths expanded its online plans with an online ordering webpage and developed a strategy to facilitate delivery of goods in a more-timely manner for online orders delivered to home.

In February 2012 Woolworths launched a concept known as the “virtual store” at Flinders Street Station in Melbourne and Town Hall Station in Sydney.

In a bid to capitalise on consumers’ increasing need for convenient and time efficient solutions, Woolworths has combined public transport and grocery shopping by taking online ordering to a station near you well to stations in the Sydney and Melbourne CBDs anyway. The retailer has launched its first virtual store in Sydney last night, with Melbourne to follow today, claiming this to be a first for Australian supermarkets.

Currently stocking 120 different products, the first virtual store is located on the concourse level of Sydney’s Town Hall station, between the Park Street and George Street exits, with Melbourne’s store being showcased at Flinders Street Station. Potential customers are able to go ‘in store’ and browse a range of product photos, each marked with a barcode or QR code. Using the Woolworths’ Android or iPhone app to scan the codes of wanted product, orders are then placed and finalised via Woolworths’ online store, with the orders being filled by bricks and mortar shops close to the delivery address. The retailer’s usual $30 online minimum order value and delivery charges still apply.

In 2013, Woolworths online strategy expanded to include a similar model as that found overseas, with the implementation of a “dark store”:

*It looks like a normal supermarket, complete with fruit and vegetables, meat and freshly baked bread, but there’s one thing missing from Woolworths’ newest store – the customers.*

Woolworths has opened its first dedicated online store at Mascot, in the heart of the biggest online retail market in Australia.

Australia’s largest retailer currently picks products to fulfil online grocery orders from supermarkets closest to online shoppers’ homes.

*But, as online grocery shopping becomes increasingly popular, Woolworths is considering opening dedicated online stores – also known as dark stores or “shadow warehouses” – in each of its major markets.*

According to consulting firm AT Kearney, which has analysed dark stores operated by retailers such as Tesco, Asda, Sainsbury and Waitrose, dedicated online fulfilment stores can be almost three times more efficient than traditional supermarkets.

*Retailers can fulfil online orders faster because dark stores are laid out for optimal picking and pickers or “personal shoppers” can whirl their trolleys around night and day, without having to navigate around slow-moving customers, promotions and checkout queues.*


By August 2014, Woolworths online grocery shopping was the fastest growing segment of the business, with sales up 50% on the previous year.


In April 2015, Woolworths launched with eBay a pilot “click & collect” partnership involving a parcel drop off service. Woolworths Lane Cove, Neutral Bay Village, Northbridge, Double Bay and Balgowlah were selected to take part in the parcel drop-off pilot.


This “click & collect” service was expanded by Woolworths in February 2016 in partnering with Sydney Trains a 12 month trial, allowing customers to shop online with Woolworths and pick up their groceries from specially design lockers on their way home.


Now, the “click & collect” service has now been expanded to a number of existing and new stores so as to keep pace with customers’ expectations.
Woolworths Corporate Property team have been tasked within finding new ways to innovate in support of a number of Woolworths’ business objectives, in particular, finding ways to support Woolworths’ “multi-option retailing” model as discussed in Section 1.1 of this report.

“Multi-option retailing” is Woolworths response to the growth in online retailing, and has forced traditional retailing to diversify. Customers are no longer relying on just traditional “bricks- and-mortar” outlets to be the sole source to undertake their shopping. It is Woolworths’ position that in order for its model, for online retailing of convenience grocery goods, to be successful, the selection of sites needs to provide the best opportunity to support the model and allow flexibility into the future.

As such, a strategic southern metropolitan Sydney location for a “bricks-and-mortar” retail supermarket facility which supports a dedicated “click & collect” and online fulfilment warehousing and distribution function with home delivery, to support the “dark store” needs to be implemented in the Sutherland LGA.

To evaluate the implementation of Direction 1.9 “Support Priority Economic Sectors”, and its Action 1.9.2 “support key industrial precincts with appropriate planning controls” as contained in A Plan for Growing Sydney, which is applicable to retailing in all its forms, an analysis of the supply of supermarket floor space has been undertaken by MacroPlan Dimasi in the Sutherland LGA, which is discussed in the next Chapter.
4. ANALYSIS OF SUPERMARKET FLOOR SPACE IN SUTHERLAND LGA

4.1 WOOLWORTHS LAND AREA REQUIREMENTS FOR RETAIL SUPERMARKETS AND LAND USE SURVEYS

4.1.1 Woolworths Land Area Requirements for Retail Supermarkets

The following is a list of requirements for identifying land suitable to support a full-line Woolworths supermarket:

1) Site to be between 10,000 square metres and 20,000 square metres in land area;
2) Main road frontage position;
3) Access into and out of the site from the primary main road frontage in both directions to be ideally via traffic signals to allow for customers to undertake all movements into and out of the site;
4) Access for large trucks to service and manoeuvre associated with a recessed loading dock;
5) Land zoned for permissible development or capable of being zoned for permissible development;
6) Convenient and two-way aisle movement in car parking layout;
7) Ability for the supermarket to trade between the hours of 6am and midnight every day;
8) Trade area catchment of some 9000 people;
9) Not already located within an existing trade area;
10) Land is capable of urban development; and
11) Land generally free of land use hazards, or if there are any, ensure these are hazards that can be overcome/rectified.

4.1.2 Land Use Surveys

This report outlines the methodology utilised to complete the land use surveys, lists the requirements for land to be suitable for a full-line Woolworths supermarket, and concludes with a list of existing locations which have been deemed suitable to support a full-line Woolworths supermarket.
**Methodology**

a. Define the precinct/area to be studied based on zoned land boundaries, and obtain cadastre maps from Spatial Information Exchange Maps to create the base mapping.

b. Analyse restrictions by examining information from the following LEP maps:
   - Land Zoning
   - Height of Buildings
   - Floor Space Ratio
   - Heritage
   - Acid Sulfate Soils
   - Flood Planning
   - Terrestrial Biodiversity

c. Undertake a desktop review of the precinct to establish land uses by using websites including:
   - NSW Department of Planning and Environment websites [https://www.planningportal.nsw.gov.au/find-a-property],
   - Google Earth [https://www.google.com.au/maps],
   - Google Street View [https://www.google.com.au/maps],
   - Spatial Information Exchange [https://maps.six.nsw.gov.au/]

d. Capture information from the precinct cadastre and convert into maps of a scale useable for physical field trip surveys;

e. Use Google Earth and Google Street View to analyse to precinct site by site to see what types of uses exist on them, and if all the existing zoned land is being used or only a proportion;
f. Perform an on-site visit to verify desktop analysis results, and take photos of each building;

g. Using the desktop data, undertake field visits to “ground truth” the data;

h. Evaluate which parcels of land are capable of large format retailing with at-grade parking.

A copy of these surveys can be found at Appendix A.

In order to identify suitable land based on the criteria above, land use surveys for the Taren Point employment area and the Caringbah centre. These surveys were completed in March and May 2016, to understand the existing site specific land use activities currently undertaken in each locality and to identify any site specific opportunities for new retail supermarket floor space. In addition, the work by MacroPlan Dimasi has included an evaluation of whether sites within Miranda, Caringbah, Sylvania and Taren Point exist which may be suitable to support new supermarket retail floor space. An extract is below:

... The sequential test requires proponents to assess the potential for available in-centre or edge-of-centre sites and to demonstrate reasons as to why alternative site options cannot be pursued, if they exist, before consideration is given to an out-of-centre location. The steps involved are:

- Step 1 - Firstly, it must be demonstrated that there are no suitable sites within an existing or planned new activity centre that can accommodate the demand by adjusting future intentions, which could include:
  - Increasing height and floor space controls,
  - Permitting a broader mix of uses, or
  - Actions to facilitate site availability or site consolidation.
- Step 2 - Secondly, it must then be demonstrated that there are no suitable sites in an edge-of-centre location that can satisfy the demand to be accommodated.
- Step 3 - Thirdly, an out-of-activity centre site that can satisfy the demand to be accommodated may be considered if it meets the Site Suitability Criteria and is consistent with relevant local or regional planning strategy.

... All except one of the existing full-line supermarkets in Sutherland Shire LGA are located in either B3 – Commercial Core or B2 – Local Centre zoned land, with the Taren Point Supa IGA located in the IN1 – General Industrial zone. We have examined the existing B3 – Commercial Core zoned precincts (as well as edge-of-precinct locations) at Miranda, Caringbah and Sylvania in the Sutherland Shire LGA which are considered to be within a reasonable distance of the subject site, in order to identify potential sites that could realistically accommodate the proposed development concept being considered by Woolworths Limited. We note there are no B2 – Local Centre or B4 – Mixed use precincts within a reasonable distance of the site. We have also reviewed the network of B5 – Business Development and B7 – Business Park zoned land within Taren Point and Caringbah.
We have only considered sites within an approximate 4km distance, by road, of the subject site. In our view, and as demonstrated earlier by the Quantium analysis, we consider that centres/sites further away than this would not be practical alternative sites to accommodate supermarket development to meet the needs of the population within the identified main trade area (i.e. residents of Taren Point, Sylvania Waters and northern Miranda and Caringbah). Indeed, we consider the investigation area we have assessed to be extensive given the supermarket trends and behaviours of Taren Point residents discussed earlier.

For the each selected centre/site in this section we have applied a consistent assessment matrix that examines various criteria in relation to site suitability, availability and viability. We have assessed site areas, lot configuration (i.e. ownership, depth, road networks and loading requirements), land use conflicts, existing and proposed uses. We have examined the potential edge-of-centre sites as well.

The proposed development concept consists of uses that would typically be accommodated in the B3 – Commercial Core and B2 – Local Centre, where particular regard has been given to those sites that are reasonably closely located to the Taren Point subject site. The ‘centres’ we have examined for potential opportunities, are listed below:

1. Miranda – B3 zone
2. Caringbah – B3 zone
3. Southgate Sylvania – B3 zone

We have also assessed the surrounding B5 and B7 zoned land, even though full-scale supermarket facilities are not supported in this zone according to the Sutherland Shire LEP 2015, including:

4. Taren Point/Caringbah – B5 and B7 zone

**Miranda – B3 Zoned Land evaluation**

The Miranda B3 – Commercial Core zoned land is generally located around the intersection of Kingsway and Kiora Road, covering an area of around 203,700 square metres (i.e. 20.37 ha). Miranda Westfield has grown to over 127,000 square metres of floor space with a trade area catchment which extends as far south as Wollongong. It also includes a range of recreation and entertainment facilities.

The evaluation by MacroPlan Dimasi indicates:

The centre currently accommodates a range of uses which are outlined in detail in Table 7.1, with very limited vacant land identified within the precinct. In order for a full-line supermarket of 3,800 sq.m to be developed on any site within the Miranda B3 zone, the entire site would need to be redeveloped, and in many cases multiple sites would need to be amalgamated, and existing uses at the site would need to be removed, including existing retail, commercial, medical, community and other uses. This outcome is not considered possible nor feasible, and would result in much lower net community benefit, compared to a scenario where the proposed supermarket development concept is developed at the Taren Point subject site.

In addition the Miranda B3 zone already provides an extensive range of retail facilities, including five supermarkets, with Woolworths already represented within the Westfield shopping centre with a large 4,700 sq.m store. Even if an additional supermarket could be physically provided within the Miranda B3 zone, this would not help meet the market gap in Taren Point, where the residents and workers of Taren Point would be required to drive over 2 km to access the supermarket offer in this location further adding to congestion within the town centre. Indeed it would provide virtually no additional net community benefit given the provision of five supermarkets already.
## Table 7.1
Taren Point- Miranda Sequential Test Analysis (Site Specific)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Site</th>
<th>Zoned</th>
<th>Area (sq m)</th>
<th>Site details</th>
<th>Vacant Area</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Parkside Plaza</td>
<td>B3</td>
<td>11,500</td>
<td>The existing shopping centre building on-grade care park occupy the entire site.</td>
<td>None</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Kiora mall</td>
<td>B3</td>
<td>7,500</td>
<td>The existing mixed-use residential building and shopping centre (including spotlight) with basement car park occupy the entire site.</td>
<td>None</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Aldi Miranda</td>
<td>B3</td>
<td>3,800</td>
<td>The existing ALDI supermarket with undercroft car park, as well as decked diggers club car park occupy entire site.</td>
<td>None</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Miranda RSL</td>
<td>B3</td>
<td>1,400</td>
<td>Site completely occupied by the existing Miranda RSL Diggers Club.</td>
<td>None</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>KFC</td>
<td>B3</td>
<td>1,200</td>
<td>Site completely occupied by the existing KFC and on-grade car park.</td>
<td>None</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Westfield Miranda</td>
<td>B3</td>
<td>74,700</td>
<td>The Existing Westfield shopping centre and associated car park extends over three blocks with no vacant land for additional development.</td>
<td>None</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Miranda Hotel</td>
<td>B3</td>
<td>2,600</td>
<td>Site completely occupied by the existing Miranda Hotel.</td>
<td>None</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Telstra Phone Exchange</td>
<td>B3</td>
<td>1,800</td>
<td>Site completely occupied by the existing Telstra phone exchange.</td>
<td>None</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Miranda Police Station</td>
<td>B3</td>
<td>2,500</td>
<td>Site completely occupied by the existing Police Station.</td>
<td>None</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Kingsway North</td>
<td>B3</td>
<td>4,600</td>
<td>The existing Gymea-Miranda Uniting Church, South point Towers commercial and residential building, Shire Legal/Solar and Stock Lawyers Commercial Buildings and The Salvation Army Miranda extends over several blocks.</td>
<td>None</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Miranda Apartments (North)</td>
<td>B3</td>
<td>26,500</td>
<td>The existing medium-high density residential buildings with undercroft or basement car parks located along Willcock Avenue (north and south), The Wilshire residential building, as well as medium-high density residential buildings on Wandella Road and Central Road extend over several blocks with no vacant land for development.</td>
<td>None</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Miranda Commercial/Retail Strip</td>
<td>B3</td>
<td>22,100</td>
<td>The existing retail, commercial and medical uses including Anytime Fitness, Specialist Medical centre, Specialist Sports medicine centre, Miranda Medical Centre, Kar Pro Tyre and Auto, Ray White and HYA Yoga, as well as other uses such as St Lukes Miranda Anglican Church, Metro Inn Miranda and Mixed use of developments including medium-high density residential Lavita and the corner of Wandella Road extend over several blocks with no vacant land for additional development.</td>
<td>None</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Miranda Remainder (South Kingsway)</td>
<td>B3</td>
<td>43,500</td>
<td>The existing Miranda Library, retail, commercial and medical uses including Liquor Bank, Vet, Medical Imaging, Ophthalmologist, Urunga Medical Centre, Offices, medium density residential buildings and residential dwellings extent over several blocks with no vacant land for additional development.</td>
<td>None</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
The centre is surrounded by R3 – Medium density residential and R4 – High density residential zoned land, as well as RE1 – Public recreation zoned parkland and SP2 – Infrastructure zoned educational establishments.

Any reduction in the supply of residential land may lead to a decrease in the supply of residential dwellings, which by extension may impact housing affordability. A rezoning of residential lands to accommodate the proposed development would be impractical and most certainly constitutes a very significant adverse outcome for the local community. It would also be unviable to redevelop medium-high density residential blocks for a ground level retail development. Therefore we do not consider that any edge-of-centre locations with established or planned future residential development should be considered as a potential site for a full-line supermarket.

Details of recent JRPP approvals in Miranda B3 zoned land:

There have been no approvals granted by the JRPP to note.

**Caringbah – B3 Zoned Land evaluation**

The Caringbah B3 – Commercial Core zoned land incorporates around 115,000 square metres (i.e. 11.5 ha) of B3 zoned land, situated around the intersection of Kingsway, Port Hacking Road and President Avenue.

The evaluation by MacroPlan Dimasi indicates:

...The centre currently accommodates a range of uses which are outlined in detail in Table 7.2, with an extensive range of retail facilities provided that comprises two full line supermarkets including Woolworths of 4,400 sq.m. There is minimal vacant land identified within the precinct. There are a number of on-grade car parks however these are either too small to accommodate the proposed development concept (e.g. 1,300 sq.m Port Hacking Road/Caringbah library car park; 2,600 sq.m Jacaranda Road/YMCA car park; and 3,300 sq.m Hay Lane car park), are likely to be redeveloped as part of future supermarket developments (i.e. Coles Caringbah) or would require existing car-parking to be moved and provided underground or above other uses. This may not even be physically possible, and could require redevelopment of surrounding sites, which may not even be feasible. Additional development would encroach on existing car parking and require additional car parking be provided, where redevelopment would need to be of considerable scale to offset costs for underground/rooftop parking. In this context no site is considered to be a viable, timely alternative.

Any other opportunity to develop within the Caringbah B3 zone would require an entire site to be redeveloped, and in many cases multiple sites would need to be amalgamated, with the existing uses at the site removed and resulting in much lower net community benefit. Further, the residents and workers of Taren Point would have to drive almost 3 km to access the supermarket offer in this location which would further add to congestion within the town centre.

The centre is surrounded by R3 – Medium density residential and R4 – High density residential zoned land, as well as RE1 – Public recreation zoned parkland and SP2 – Infrastructure zoned educational establishments.

For similar reasons explained earlier, we do not consider the loss of adjacent residential dwellings or recreation and infrastructure zoned land to be appropriate to accommodate a full-line supermarket. Thus no practical edge of centre locations exist in Caringbah to accommodate the proposed development concept.
A comprehensive land use survey of the current uses of all properties was undertaken as at the end of May 2016. This survey can be found in at Appendix A.

This survey indicates the specific tenants within each of the existing buildings along Taren Point Road from the intersection of Holt Road to the intersection of Captain Cook Drive, and along Parraween Road from Kareena Road to Erskine Road.

This survey has identified a number of supermarkets already exist within Caringbah, however limited opportunity exists for new locations.
Details of recent JRPP approvals in Caringbah B3 zoned land:

**Table 1: Summary of JRPP approvals in Caringbah B3**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>DA number</th>
<th>Address</th>
<th>Description</th>
<th>Lodgement Date</th>
<th>Determined Date</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>DA15/0016</td>
<td>46-48 President Avenue</td>
<td>Demolition of Existing Structure, Remediation of Land and Construction of Mixed Use Development Consisting of Ground Floor Commercial/Retail Suites, 25 Residential Units and Basement Car Parking</td>
<td>15/01/15</td>
<td>20/08/15</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Sylvania – B3 Zoned Land evaluation**

The Sylvania – B3 Commercial Core zoned land is located around 4 km north-west of the Taren Point employment area, and includes around 49,700 square metres of (4.97 ha) of B3 zoned land at Southgate Sylvania. The evaluation by MacroPlan Dimasi indicates:

... The range of uses accommodated within this centre is outlined in Table 7.3, where all lots within the precinct support functional and operational uses, with no vacant land identified within the precinct. The at-grade car parking area services the Southgate Sylvania shopping centre. Further the existing retail facilities at the centre include two supermarkets, with Woolworths already represented within the centre, and would require Taren Point residents and workers to drive almost 4 km to the centre contributing to increased congestion.

The centre is surrounded by R2 – Low Density Residential, R3 – Medium density residential and R4 – High density residential zoned land. For similar reasons explained earlier, we do not consider the loss of adjacent residential dwellings appropriate to accommodate a full-line supermarket. Thus no practical edge of centre locations exist to accommodate the proposed development concept.

**Table 7.3**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Site</th>
<th>Zoned</th>
<th>Area (sq m)</th>
<th>Site details</th>
<th>Vacant Area</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Southgate Sylvania</td>
<td>B3</td>
<td>39,500</td>
<td>The existing shopping centre building and on-grade car parking occupy entire site.</td>
<td>None</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Fitness First</td>
<td>B3</td>
<td>3,200</td>
<td>Site completely occupied by existing Fitness first building and undercroft car park.</td>
<td>None</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Crest Hotel</td>
<td>B3</td>
<td>3,700</td>
<td>The existing tavern, TAB and drive through liquor store occupy the entire site.</td>
<td>None</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>McDonald’s</td>
<td>B3</td>
<td>2,100</td>
<td>Site completely occupied by existing McDonald’s building, playground and on-grade car park.</td>
<td>None</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sylvania Remainder</td>
<td>B3</td>
<td>1,200</td>
<td>Site completely occupied by existing commercial office building.</td>
<td>None</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

There have been no approvals granted by the JRPP to note.

**Taren Point Employment Area – B5, B7 and IN1 Zoned Land evaluation**

Taren Point Employment Area incorporates approximately 205,000 square metres of (20.50 ha) of B5 zoned land and 419,400 square metres (41.94 ha) of B7 zoned land, situated between 0.4 km and 2.8 km east of the subject site between Taren Point Road and Captain Cook Drive.
It is noted that the land described along Taren Point Road and Parraweena Road has been rezoned to B5 Business Development under the SLEP 2015.

Not all of the premises and current uses within the Taren Point Employment Area were approved under the current main environmental planning instrument (EPI) applicable to land within the LGA being the SLEP 2015.

A number were approved under the former EPI being the Sutherland Local Environmental Plan 2006 (SLEP 2006) which was amended to identify on a map where “bulk goods premises” were permitted on land in Zone 11 – Employment. This map extended along Taren Point Road and Parraweena Road in the locations as previously described.

As can be seen in land use survey, while a number of these uses within existing buildings along Taren Point Road would in general be considered to be a type of “bulky good premises” as now defined under the SLEP 2015, not all of the uses sell goods that are of such size or weight that would be considered to be large in size but rather sell goods which in the majority could be described as small in size and being offered potentially as a bulk buying opportunity.

If fact a number of the goods offered for sale in some of the premises along Taren Point Road would readily be located on the shelf of a supermarket. The SLEP 2015 defines “bulky goods premises” as follows:

*bulky goods premises* means a building or place the principal purpose of which is the sale, hire or display of bulky goods, being goods that are of such size or weight as to require:

(a) a large area for handling, display or storage, and

(b) direct vehicular access to the site of the building or place by members of the public for the purpose of loading or unloading such goods into or from their vehicles after purchase or hire,

and including goods such as floor and window supplies, furniture, household electrical goods, equestrian supplies and swimming pools, but does not include a building or place used for the sale of foodstuffs or clothing unless their sale is ancillary to the sale or hire or display of bulky goods.

This is the same definition as that which applied under the former EPI Sutherland Local Environmental Plan 2006, for which the land along

**Zone 11—Employment**

**1 Objectives of zone**

The objectives of this zone are as follows:

(a) to ensure development supports the role and functioning of employment areas,

(b) to promote appropriate development that will contribute to employment generation and the economic growth of Sutherland Shire,

(c) to provide for a range of related land uses to provide direct services to employees,

(d) to provide for development for the purposes of shops and businesses ancillary to other development carried out on the land concerned,

(e) to provide for bulky goods premises only on selected sites.
2 Development allowed without consent
Development for the purpose of:

- 
  - bush fire hazard reduction work, drainage.

Exempt development.

3 Development allowed only with consent
Development (other than development included in item 2) for the purpose of:

- advertisements, animal boarding or training establishments (not including a riding school),
- arts and crafts centres, awnings, brothels, bulky goods premises (but only on land identified on the map for such a purpose), bus depots, business identification signs, car parks, childcare centres, community facilities, convenience stores, dwelling houses ancillary to other permissible uses, food shops, generating works, high technology industries, industries, junk yards, liquid fuel depots, maritime activities, motor showrooms, nightclubs, passenger transport facilities, places of public worship, recreation areas, recreation facilities, registered clubs, repair centres, road transport terminals, roads, service stations, service support industries, sex shops, utility installations, vehicle and mechanical repair premises, vehicle rental centres, veterinary hospitals, warehouses, waste recycling and management centres.

Demolition not included in item 2.

4 Prohibited development
Any development not included in item 2 or 3.

A comprehensive land use survey of the current uses of all properties along Parraweena Road and Taren Point Road was undertaken as at the end of May 2016. This survey can be found in at Appendix A.

This precinct is generally found along the eastern side of Taren Point Road from 94 Taren Point Road to 244 Taren Point Road and includes buildings such as the Caringbah Homemaker Centre which is the section of Taren Point Road south of Parraweena Road. In addition, this precinct extends along 89-97 Parraweena Road and 40-40A Parraweena Road to the east of Taren Point Road intersection with Parraweena Road which is located approximately 330 metres to the east of the subject site. This survey indicates the specific tenants within each of the existing buildings along Taren Point Road and Parraweena Road.

Photographs 1 – 8 (Photos) below demonstrate some of the existing development and uses within the “Taren Point Employment Area”.
Photo 1: View of Caringbah Homemaker Centre fronting Taren Point Road with over 30 shops including Freedom Furniture, JB HiFi, Harvey Norman, and Fantastic Furniture, etc.

Photo 2: View of existing building and uses on corner of Taren Point Road and Koonya Circuit including Oporto, Subway and Petbarn.

Photo 3: View of existing Bunnings development at 31-35 Willarong Road.

Photo 4: View of Taren Point McDonalds at corner of Taren Point Road and Koonya Circuit.

Photo 5: View of Officeworks on Taren Point Road.

Photo 6: View of Baby Bunting and Workout World on Taren Point Road.
In summary, it has been identified that a number of existing buildings in the locality are currently being used for retail activities, which seek to trade to the high movement of traffic along Taren Point Road and Parraweena Road.

The evaluation by MacroPlan Dimasi of the Taren Point employment area indicates:

...The extensive range of uses accommodated in this precinct is outlined in Table 7.4, with limited vacant land identified in the precinct. Most of the identified B5 and B7 zoned land parcels are occupied by functional, operating bulky goods, commercial and light industrial uses.

The vacant sites identified across the precinct include:

- A vacant building on the corner of Box Road and Taren Point Road, previously occupied by Bob Jane T-mart before they relocated near the corner of Taren Point Road and Bay Road, however this site is not large enough to accommodate the proposed development, at around 1,000 sq.m.
- A vacant lot is located on the corner of Captain Cook Highway and Willarong Road, which was previously approved for bulky goods retail outlet with basement car park. This 4,600 sq.m site is not large enough to accommodate the proposed 3,800 sq.m supermarket (4,000 sq.m centre) with on-grade car parking and would result in a development much less convenient than the proposal. This site is also located closer to the proposed Bay Central shopping centre (likely to include Woolworths), and is relatively close to the existing Caringbah town centre, which is located around 1km south. Therefore this site is not deemed appropriate for the proposed development concept.
- A vacant lot is located adjacent to the existing ARV Woolooware Shores retirement village; however this site has been rezoned to accommodate future retirement living units and a purpose built dementia care unit. Purchase of this site was to be finalised and settled by 30th June 2016. The site is therefore not deemed appropriate for the proposed development concept.
- There are currently vacant sites located in a newly developed industrial estate known as Sutherland Shire Industrial Estate (developed by Leda); however the majority of sites are sold and are expected to be taken up by industrial uses in the near future.
In addition, the existing Toyota Australia site in Caringbah is due to close in 2017. The entire 123,900 sq.m site is likely to be redeveloped in the future however this process will no doubt occur over the medium to long term. In addition, this site is located in close proximity to the proposed Bay Central shopping centre, where Woolworths are likely to already be represented, and Taren Point residents would still be required to travel almost 4 km to the site, adding to congestion throughout this precinct.

This area is surrounded by R2 – Low Density Residential, RE1 – Public recreation zoned parkland and SP2 – Infrastructure zoned educational establishments, as well as IN1 – General Industrial, IN2 – Light Industrial. For reasons outlined earlier, we do not consider the loss of adjacent residential dwellings or development of recreation and infrastructure zoned land to be appropriate to accommodate a full-line supermarket. This subject site is located within the IN1 – General Industrial precinct, and is considered the most appropriate site within the industrial zone to accommodate the proposed development concept given its colocation with the existing Supa IGA Taren Point, surrounding residential population and distance from surrounding centres where smaller impacts are spread across a range of retail facilities/centres rather than impacting any one centre to a moderate-high degree.

In addition, the existing Toyota Australia site in Caringbah is due to close in 2017. The entire 123,900 sq.m site is likely to be redeveloped in the future however this process will no doubt occur over the medium to long term. In addition, this site is located in close proximity to the proposed Bay Central shopping centre, where Woolworths are likely to already be represented, and Taren Point residents would still be required to travel almost 4 km to the site, adding to congestion throughout this precinct.

This area is surrounded by R2 – Low Density Residential, RE1 – Public recreation zoned parkland and SP2 – Infrastructure zoned educational establishments, as well as IN1 – General Industrial, IN2 – Light Industrial. For reasons outlined earlier, we do not consider the loss of adjacent residential dwellings or development of recreation and infrastructure zoned land to be appropriate to accommodate a full-line supermarket. This subject site is located within the IN1 – General Industrial precinct, and is considered the most appropriate site within the industrial zone to accommodate the proposed development concept given its colocation with the existing Supa IGA Taren Point, surrounding residential population and distance from surrounding centres where smaller impacts are spread across a range of retail facilities/centres rather than impacting any one centre to a moderate-high degree.
4.2 SITES PREVIOUSLY PROPOSED BY WOOLWORTHS

Over the last ten year period, no new or expanded Woolworths supermarket facilities have been realised in the Sutherland LGA, other than a “Part 3A Concept Plan and Project Application approval” which will include a lease by Woolworths for a full-line supermarket at “Cronulla Sharks”.

The following section provides a summary of a number of recent actions by Woolworths through Fabcot, to provide new retail supermarket floor space within the LGA:

4.2.1 Development Application at Barden Ridge

In August 2011, Fabcot submitted a Development Application (DA) to Council at 152 Old Illawarra Road, Barden Ridge.

The DA was refused by the JRPP.
4.2.2 Planning Proposal at Barden Ridge

As a result of the refusal of this DA and based in part on the feedback in the determination meeting, in December 2012 Fabcot submitted a site specific planning proposal for the land at 152 Old Illawarra Road, Barden Ridge. This site specific planning proposal sought to change the zoning of the land from Zone 10 – Neighbourhood Centre to Zone 9 – Local Centre under the former main environmental planning instrument which affected the land, being the Sutherland Local Environmental Plan 2006.

The JRPP recommended the Planning Proposal be forwarded for a Gateway determination on 29 May 2015. However, the DP&E wrote to the applicant via letter dated 12 December 2015 to advise following exhibition that the planning proposal will not be concluded with a plan amendment.

4.2.3 Development Application at Kirrawee

Woolworths lodged a DA in December 2013, at 28-38 Flora Street, Kirrawee for a proposed commercial building for a retail supermarket and associated facilities. The Council assessment report on this DA presented to the JRPP at its meeting on 3 April 2014 refused the DA.

4.3 WOOLWORTHS VOICE OF THE CUSTOMER

Woolworths Voice of the Customer (VOC) is a process where Everyday Rewards customers are invited to respond to online surveys following a shop at a particular store, so as Woolworths can capture a customer’s expectations, preferences and aversions. Essentially, VOC is a market research technique that produces a detailed set of customer wants and needs, which are then organised and prioritised into a hierarchical structure in terms of importance and satisfaction with current alternatives for customers to identify where improvements need to be made.

Table 2 below, provides a summary of customer feedback associated with the Miranda, Sylvania and Caringbah Woolworths stores which a new facility at Taren Point would assist in resolving:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Response Date</th>
<th>Time of Day</th>
<th>Store Name</th>
<th>Customer Comment</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>23/09/16</td>
<td>3-6pm</td>
<td>Miranda</td>
<td>&quot;I don't shop at Miranda generally. I do not find grocery shopping at Westfield convenient&quot;</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>19/09/16</td>
<td>9-12pm</td>
<td>Miranda</td>
<td>&quot;Nothing against woolworths I always have a great time it’s more the problem of getting there sometimes to shop over the weekend I have to go somewhere else due to the congestion of Miranda fair&quot;</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>22/09/16</td>
<td>9-12pm</td>
<td>Miranda</td>
<td>&quot;Variety is less in some areas, especially freezer section. Very busy at times and customers agitated in this store I find.&quot;</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>06/09/16</td>
<td>9-12pm</td>
<td>Miranda</td>
<td>&quot;I basically don't really like Woolworths Miranda, I don't really know what it is. Specific problems include the fact that I just&quot;</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Response Date</td>
<td>Time of Day</td>
<td>Store Name</td>
<td>Customer Comment</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>---------------</td>
<td>-------------</td>
<td>------------</td>
<td>------------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>02/07/16</td>
<td>3-6pm</td>
<td>Miranda</td>
<td>&quot;Woolworths Miranda has fresh fruit &amp; vegetables and good service. However it is a busy supermarket and it can get crowded in there.&quot;</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12/10/16</td>
<td>9-12pm</td>
<td>Caringbah</td>
<td>Coles Caringbah just doesn't work for me the parking is great, but that's all they have going for them. Ritchies IGA, Taren Point would work for me but they are more expensive. My daughter works there and even the staff discount wouldn't be cheaper than Woolies for the items that I want. I've tried Aldi, don't mind it but the weekly shop doesn't give me the favourite items on a regular basis. I would HATE to do my weekly supermarket shop at Miranda Fair. If I know it's a bad parking time at Woolies I'll duck to a little corner store or the IGA on Port Hacking Road, for the odd thing I need.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>01/11/15</td>
<td>9-12am</td>
<td>Miranda</td>
<td>&quot;parking at Westfield Miranda is a nightmare especially on the weekends (day and night)....Carpark is a nightmare but it isn't Woolworths fault&quot;</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>17/11/15</td>
<td>12-3pm</td>
<td>Sylvania</td>
<td>&quot;carpark is always full&quot;</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>08/12/15</td>
<td>6-9pm</td>
<td>Miranda</td>
<td>&quot;Difficult to get your groceries back to the car if you park in any of the old undercover carparks&quot;</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10/05/16</td>
<td>3-6pm</td>
<td>Caringbah</td>
<td>&quot;The parking is very limited and there's impatient people in the carpark. I was there at 4.30 thinking it would be a good time... I shop at either Menai, Miranda or Caringbah&quot;</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>14/09/16</td>
<td>12-3pm</td>
<td>Caringbah</td>
<td>&quot;More exits from your carpark. At peak times there can be a queue to get out of the lower carpark&quot;</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>21/11/16</td>
<td>9-12pm</td>
<td>Caringbah</td>
<td>&quot;I mostly shop Sunday afternoon. But it's extremely busy and hard to park. So sometimes shop Monday morning around 8.30&quot;</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>20/11/16</td>
<td>6-9pm</td>
<td>Caringbah</td>
<td>&quot;Parking is often very difficult.&quot;</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>07/11/16</td>
<td>12-3pm</td>
<td>Miranda</td>
<td>&quot;Too busy&quot;</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>08/11/16</td>
<td>3-6pm</td>
<td>Caringbah</td>
<td>&quot;More parking&quot;</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>01/11/16</td>
<td>9-12pm</td>
<td>Caringbah</td>
<td>&quot;The exit from the car park is getting increasingly difficult - forced to turn left from ground floor and then there is often a build up inside that carpark because the traffic is already full to the traffic lights. Probably a council problem but exit from the other level is even worse as the street is very narrow and always parked on both sides!&quot;</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>26/09/16</td>
<td>3-6pm</td>
<td>Caringbah</td>
<td>&quot;I try to limit my visits to times when I don't think the centre will be busy so normally go at night or early in the mornings.&quot;</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>18/08/16</td>
<td>12-3pm</td>
<td>Caringbah</td>
<td>&quot;Parking is difficult and the traffic flow is confusing and frustrating.&quot;</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Response Date</td>
<td>Time of Day</td>
<td>Store Name</td>
<td>Customer Comment</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>---------------</td>
<td>-------------</td>
<td>------------</td>
<td>------------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>18/04/16</td>
<td>6-9pm</td>
<td>Caringbah</td>
<td>&quot;Top car park has always been an issue with bank up of traffic during busy times. I have seen a couple of designs over the years but they all seem to bottleneck somewhere.&quot;</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>24/03/16</td>
<td>3-6pm</td>
<td>Caringbah</td>
<td>&quot;Better access in and out of the car park, particularly leaving the underground car park onto Willarong Road where street traffic bank up therefore not allowing access out of the car park.&quot;</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>23/01/16</td>
<td>6-9am</td>
<td>Caringbah</td>
<td>&quot;the only downside to the store is the parking area always appears to be crowded and traffic flow is a pain. the store operation is good and easy to access&quot;</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>14/04/16</td>
<td>9-12pm</td>
<td>Caringbah</td>
<td>&quot;Please address the parking issue- it’s crazy on a god day and a nightmare when its busy. The area is too small for the amount of people that use the complex. I know this is not Woolies issue per se, but would be good to address with council seeing as there are more units going up in the Caringbah area soon that will increase traffic and usage of the facilities.&quot;</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The issues of lack of parking and congested at existing centres and over-trading are repeatedly raised, each of which could be ameliorated by provision of additional supermarket stores in more accessible locations.

### 4.4 RESIDENTS SURVEY BY CROSBY TEXTOR

The work in this Planning Study and the MacroPlan Dimasi analysis discussed below at Section 4.5 have been informed by a resident survey undertaken by Crosby Textor in December 2016. This work was commissioned by Woolworths to clearly understand important issues and considerations which impact local residents decisions and community expectations associated with retail supermarket shopping in the Sutherland LGA, and in particular Ward C. Refer to Appendix B for a copy of the December 2016 survey summary.

Crosby Textor regularly undertake public opinion research for Commonwealth and State Departments, and this instance it was determined that the best way to gain feedback from Ward C residents of the Sutherland LGA would be via a telephone survey of 400 people.

The key findings of the Ward C survey included:

- **Ward C residents already recognise that the area’s population is growing, and hold concerns that this may make existing living pressures – notably traffic, housing density and job opportunities – worse.**

- **These residents are as yet unaware of the Woolworths Taren Point supermarket proposal, but once introduced it receives immediate majority support of two-thirds (with only less than a fifth opposed to any extent). This is positive.**
It must be stated that shopping facilities are not a salient issue right now, and some in Ward C find current facilities adequate, but this majority support does stem from desired choice, competition and convenience in light of growth.

Further, local residents do not seem to view this proposed supermarket as part of an ‘over-development problem’; instead, agreeing that it will help to service the population, provide jobs and facilitate urban renewal at Taren Point.

They do not generally believe that this new supermarket would necessarily solve their very salient traffic issues, but also do not think they would be made worse either (and would reduce at least some people’s travel and parking times).

Indeed, the only consistent reason for the minority opposition is that some do not see that a store is needed right now, e.g. they may have others closer.

4.5 SUTHERLAND LGA – SUPERMARKET AND CONSUMER TRENDS JULY 2016 BY MACROPLAN DIMASI

The study undertaken by Hill PDA in 2010 with respect to the Brick Pit site in Kirrawee specifically considered the supply of retail supermarket floor space within the Sutherland LGA. This study demonstrated using empirical evidence that Sutherland LGA was experiencing a significant undersupply of supermarket floor space compared to the National average and other Sydney Metropolitan Area averages.

Council in March 2013 in considering the nominating an urban activation precinct for Sutherland, acknowledged the limitation of suitable sites for new retail supermarket floor space within the Sutherland Centre and there is an undersupply of retail supermarket floor space. Council specifically resolved to seek assistance from DP&E to undertake strategic planning via the urban activation precinct program for Sutherland-Kirrawee, Miranda and Caringbah.

Woolworths has approached Council on a number of occasions over a number of years to press the case that Council should commence its own strategic study to determine the issue of the supply of retail supermarket floor space and how to resolve the issue. Woolworths has also approached Council to consider partnering to achieve potential expansion of sites for new retail supermarket floor space, however Council has advised that they are not ready to consider this approach and would need to undertake a strategic planning process.

As Council has not undertaken any study or investigations associated with verifying whether there continues to be an under-supply of retail supermarket floor space within the Sutherland LGA, and the perception that the LGA has sufficient jobs in the retail sector, Woolworths has engaged MacroPlan Dimasi to:
• Undertake an analysis of supermarket floor space provision per capita in the Sutherland LGA, including comparisons with metropolitan Sydney, NSW and Australia. This has involved examining the provision of supermarket floor space across the broader “South District” (i.e. one of the NSW DPE metro strategy sub-regions) and assesses the trading performance of local supermarkets within the Sutherland LGA;

• Undertake a further analysis of retail employment trends within the Sutherland LGA; and

• Provide a summary of economic and community impacts associated with any identified under-supply of supermarket floor space for local residents.

The analysis work prepared by MacroPlan Dimasi in 2016 builds on the work undertaken by Hill PDA in 2010.

MacroPlan Dimasi has found:

**Adverse impacts of supermarket under-supply...**

• Congestion issues/deterrent effects – from supermarkets and car parks being too busy.

• Increased travel times/costs – due to congestion and shoppers bypassing smaller/inadequate supermarkets.

• Increased supermarket/retailer profitability – which can lead to a lack of reinvestment and a decline in customer service at a local level.

• Less job opportunities - limits the retail job opportunities for local residents and increases travel times for workers who need to leave LGA.

• Potential decline of non-centre employment precincts – due to lack of local amenities.

**Small time savings add up...**

• Quantum transactional data show that the average supermarket trip distance undertaken by Sutherland residents is around 120-200% greater than the average distance to their closest supermarket.

• This means that many residents are bypassing smaller, more proximate supermarkets because they do not provide a comprehensive range of grocery items.

• If just 10% of households were able to save 1 minute per trip for 10% of their annual supermarket trips as a result of better/more convenient access to supermarket facilities this would equate to time savings across the Shire of almost 60,000 minutes or more than 40 days.
Under-supply of supermarket floor space

- There is typically around 340 sq.m of supermarket floor space per 1,000 residents across Australia.
  - There is around 313 sq.m per 1,000 residents across Australia’s capital cities, and around 338 sq.m per 1,000 residents, on average, if Sydney is excluded.
- There is around 286 sq.m of supermarket floor space per capita across the Sutherland Shire, which is around 16% below the capital cities average (ex-Sydney).
- Around 33% of all supermarket floor space is located within the Miranda and Caringbah activity centres – which are located just 2km from each other in the eastern part of the shire. Clearly, there is an imbalance in the provision of supermarket space within the Shire.
- The current under-provision of supermarket floor space across Sutherland Shire equates to around 12,000 – 13,000 sq.m (which does not account for approved future developments).

Future demand for supermarket floor space

- The Shire’s population is projected to grow from 225,610 in 2015 to 264,230 by 2031. This growth of 38,600 persons by 2031 would be equivalent to around 13,000 sq.m of additional supermarket floor space demand.
- This means a further 8 large supermarkets (above 3,000 sq.m) would be needed between now and 2031 in order for the Sutherland Shire to match the current average provision across Australian capital cities (ex-Sydney).
- There are only two large supermarkets approved for future development across the Shire (at Woolooware and Kirrawee), as well as two Aldi supermarkets which are much smaller – providing a limited range of items.

Lack of retail job opportunities

- As at the 2011 Census, there were around 110,500 resident workers in the Sutherland Shire yet only 57,200 local jobs were available in the Shire.
- 20% of these local jobs are filled by workers from beyond the Shire, which means around 60% of Sutherland Shire resident workers leave the LGA every day for work.
- The number of jobs in the Sutherland Shire grew by around 4.8% between 2006 and 2011, yet retail jobs in the Shire declined by 1%.
- Retail trade is a key driver of the local economy, constituting around 16% of all local jobs as at 2011, the largest employing industry in the Shire. However, there was a net under-provision of retail jobs in the Sutherland Shire in 2011, with less retail jobs available in the Shire than employed residents in the retail industry.

Taren Point Locality...

- Taren Point represents a highly suitable location for additional full-line supermarket facilities because of the significant escape expenditure from this locality at present; the large daily workforce (of around 11,000 workers); and the significant amount of latent demand existing already from drivers passing through the locality along Taren Point Road (in excess of 58,000 VPD).
- This would provide Shire residents the opportunity to link supermarket trips with a trip to work (or another trip beyond the Shire) and reduce specific/dedicated trips to supermarkets throughout the Shire.
The work by MacroPlan Dimasi demonstrates that there continues to be an undersupply of retail supermarket floor space throughout the Sutherland LGA and that there is an insufficient supply of retail sector jobs within the Sutherland LGA based on the 2011 ABS statistics. This undersupply of jobs results in residents leaving the boundaries of the LGA to seek work, unlike the information prepared in the “Employment Strategy – July 2013”.

This Planning Study through the analysis work undertaken by MacroPlan Dimasi indicates that the existing undersupply of retail supermarket floor space is currently adversely affecting lifestyle choices of residents within the LGA. This is resulting in longer trips to gain access to a supermarket or diverting users to locations where convenience is compromised due to lack of available parking during peak periods because a customers have limited time windows in which to undertake a supermarket shop and no options exist other than that supermarket shop.

4.6 SUTHERLAND LGA SUPERMARKET ANALYSIS AND TAREN POINT DEEP-DIVE BY QUANTIUM

The work in this Planning Study and the MacroPlan Dimasi analysis, discussed at Section 4.5, have been informed by consumer research prepared by Quantium in April 2016.

Section 3.2.2 briefly discussed the work by Quantium associated with online retailing trends. The basis of the Quantum Market Blueprint data is the full set of electronic transactions (credit card and debit card) for all National Australia Bank (NAB) customers across Australia. The information enables Quantium to plot both the origin (i.e. the home address) and the destination (i.e. the particular store) for each transaction.

The NAB coverage means that Quantium is able to analyse and plot the actual transactional behaviours of more than 2.5 million customers nationally, which forms the basis for a detailed estimation of expenditure flows for any identified area.

Quantium was engaged to examine the actual supermarket shopping patterns of Sutherland LGA residents. The analysis by Quantium represents a very accurate picture of the actual supermarket expenditure behaviours of residents in the Sutherland LGA.

As such, the Quantum data provides a detailed analysis of actual spending behaviours by residents of the Sutherland LGA. The data provided, for the year to April 2016, reflects actual transactions conducted by all of these residents, over the 12 month period, at all supermarkets within the trade area. The data show the reality of what is currently happening in in terms of supermarket expenditure across the LGA, at a very granular level.

Quantium is able to assess where residents conduct their supermarket shopping within the Sutherland LGA, and their suburb of origin, as well as how much expenditure escapes beyond the Sutherland LGA boundaries. The Quantum report at Appendix A of the MacroPlan Dimasi research report titled “Sutherland LGA – Supermarket and Consumer Trends July 2016” presents an analysis of supermarket shopping behaviours of Sutherland LGA residents based on actual electronic transactional data.
• This showed that around 12% of all supermarket expenditure generated by Sutherland LGA residents escapes the LGA, and the average distance travelled (from home) to undertake supermarket shopping trips for residents is between 2.5-3 times greater than the distance to their nearest supermarket.

• This also showed that 75% of main trade area expenditure is not directed to Taren Point. The Quantium data indicates that people travel further than their closest supermarket, on average, to conduct their supermarket shopping trips, which means their preferences are not being met.
5. WOOLWORTHS RESPONSE TO THE NEED FOR NEW SUPERMARKET FLOOR SPACE IN THE SUTHERLAND LGA AND THE GROWTH OF ONLINE RETAILING

Woolworths has investigated a number of precincts within the Sutherland LGA for suitable land capable of accommodating new and expanded retail supermarket floor space.

Woolworths has identified that “multi-option retailing” is an important customer choice and as such a strategic southern Sydney Metropolitan Area location for a “bricks and mortar” retail supermarket facility which also supports “click & collect”, “online fulfilment” retailing with home delivery and support for the “dark box” at Mascot as part of Woolworths “multi-option retailing” being implemented in the Sutherland LGA is an important business objective.

Given the characteristics of the Taren Point Employment Area which includes a number of existing retail activities, Woolworths seeks to implement the “multi-option retailing” model at Parraweena Road, Taren Point.

5.1 BACKGROUND

Within the Sydney metropolitan region, the southern region in which Sutherland LGA forms part, supports a population where a significant proportion of residents already have access to the internet/smart devices and often seek access to goods and services in conveniently positioned locations. Woolworths have undertaken research which conclude that shifts in lifestyle choices, longer working hours, lost time spent in increasing public and private transport congestion have resulted in many families becoming increasingly time poor. This research accords with wider research which has identified the same trend as discussed previously in this section.

Market feedback has demonstrated that an increasing number of households are utilising the internet to service their retailing needs, as weekend shopping is not always possible. The site’s location in Taren Point meets the demographic needs of the locality and is an accessible location, enabling the supply chain element of freight and logistics services to access the site via an easily accessible arterial road network. The site’s location will allow direct freight and logistics links to and from the Woolworths distribution centres to regions within the Sydney metropolitan region, supporting online retail orders for convenience goods.

The following points form the critical elements of the process:

- The growth of internet retailing, i.e., “online retailing” and how location can influence its growth;
- What Woolworths considers the best approach to support its online retailing strategy to ensure its success; and
- Access for the supply chain and its requirements.
Therefore, retail supermarket facilities not only need to cater for face to face retailing, but also where customers can access to collect an order and shop directly as well as packing and sending out for delivery of orders.

5.2 WOOLWORTHS STRATEGY

The nature of retailing has rapidly changed due to the growth of online retailing. Businesses such as Woolworths recognise the need to deliver services to cater to all their customers’ needs. The needs of customers over the last 5 years since the GFC have shifted significantly in all areas of retailing, including foodstuff retailing. Convenience and flexibility are the key criteria for customers, and those retailers who did not kept pace with these desires and market dynamic have declined as a result.

Retailers such as Harvey Norman who were once sceptical of online retailing have now recognised that making an online retailing component available to customers is pivotal for their survival in the marketplace. The realisation that retailers need flexibility and convenience for their customers has led to an optimised hybrid model, with a mix of online retailing and point of sale purchasing.

Woolworths have already been exploring regional locations in Sydney to implement “click and collect” online retailing along with online ordering via distribution centres so as to complement traditional retailing in stores. This proposal for Taren Point goes one step further by seeking to blend online ordering with traditional retailing as the market in Australia for online retailing of foodstuffs is not mature enough to support a standalone, online only retail facility. The trend is continuing to grow and therefore a retailer such as Woolworths seeks to be a market leader in this area.

The site in Taren Point is ideally positioned to enable this hybrid model to function efficiently and deliver foodstuffs in all its options to southern Sydney, being a significant subregion of the wider Sydney metropolitan area. Woolworths strategy is grounded by the knowledge that the site can perform functions associated with the transit of goods to and from the Woolworths distribution centre, and allow good access for freight vehicles given the site’s proximity to good road infrastructure and the arterial road network.

5.3 FREIGHT AND LOGISTICS

Freight and logistics form an integral part of the new Woolworths business model. The multi-option retailing model includes warehousing and distribution functions associated with the online fulfilment. As such, the industrial zoning of the site at Taren Point is considered a more suitable location given the permissibility of warehousing and distribution uses.

The trend in industrial areas to incorporate logistics and warehousing uses is a dominant one not only in Sydney, but across Australia in a response to market dynamics and the evolving needs of businesses in both the industrial and retail landscape.
Figure 8 below demonstrates the increases in the amount of employed persons in the Sydney metropolitan region across all sectors, and as can be seen, there has been strong growth in the transport, postal and warehousing sector, as well as the retail sector (BITRE 2012).

Figure 8: Employed persons by industry, Sydney, 2001 and 2011 (BITRE 2012, p. 167)

The location at Parraweena Road, Taren Point is zoned IN1 General Industrial under the Sutherland Local Environmental Plan 2015 (SLEP 2015). The objectives of this zone are to:

Zone IN1 General Industrial

1 Objectives of zone

- To provide a wide range of industrial and warehouse land uses.
- To encourage employment opportunities.
- To minimise any adverse effect of industry on other land uses.
- To support and protect industrial land for industrial uses.
- To enhance the visual appearance of the employment area by ensuring new development achieves high architectural and landscape standards.
- To minimise the impact of development in the zone on areas of environmental significance.

The freight and logistics facets which support the on-line fulfilment orders are compatible with the objectives of the IN1 General Industrial zoning, and as such, the site at Parraweena Road, Taren Point is considered the most suitable location for the proposal.
6. CONCLUSION

Based on the information in this study, including:

- Woolworths site requirements for a new full-line supermarket,
- the identified undersupply of retail supermarket floor space,
- the evaluation of sites within existing centres which indicates a lack of suitable land to accommodate a new retail supermarket,

It is considered that the characteristics of the Taren Point employment area and it also being a local centre, make it a suitable location for Woolworths to seek to locate a new supermarket, while at the same time providing a brick-and-mortar facility for its multi-option retailing model.

Taren Point represents a highly suitable location for additional full-line supermarket facilities because of:

- the significant escape expenditure from this locality at present;
- the large daily workforce; and
- the significant amount of latent demand existing from drivers passing through the locality along Taren Point Road.

As such, a site specific planning proposal for the land at 130-142 Parraweena Road, Miranda has been prepared, seeking an amending clause to be included in Schedule 1 of the Sutherland Local Environmental Plan 2015 (SLEP 2015) so as the planning regime can facilitate the Woolworths business model and permit a new retail supermarket in the IN1 General Industrial zone.
APPENDIX A
Land Use Surveys
APPENDIX B
Crosby Textor Survey
APPENDIX C
Sutherland LGA Supermarket and consumer trends review by MacroPlan Dimasi July 2016 including Sutherland LGA analysis and Taren Point deep-dive April 2016 by Quantum
The aim of this survey was to provide public opinion-based insights to the Woolworths team and other key decision-makers on the proposed supermarket development at Taren Point in the Sutherland Shire LGA.

N.B. This second piece of research updates and supersedes the March 2016 consultation, which is now outdated, included the views of the entire LGA (rather than just the immediate area in Ward C) and looked at the general concept of a local development (rather than this specific supermarket proposal).

The latest survey methodology was designed and administered as follows:

- A representative telephone (CATI) survey of local residents in Ward C (only).
- A sample size of n=400, accurate to a +/-4.9% max. margin of error (at the 95% CI).
- Data collected between 9th and 12th December 2016.

Questionnaire design included the following lines of questioning:

- Issue agenda (spontaneous and prompted).
- Awareness of and support for the proposed supermarket development.
- Reasons for support or opposition (spontaneous and prompted).

Indicative trends have been presented against past results in Ward C (only).
## Survey Analysis Groups

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Group</th>
<th>Definition</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Total Mar 2016</strong></td>
<td>Weighted results for all residents in Ward C in the March 2016 CATI survey. N.B. This uses a limited sample size as a sub-set of the total Sutherland Shire LGA survey, and should be treated with caution</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Total Dec 2016</strong></td>
<td>Weighted results for all residents in Ward C in the December 2016 CATI survey</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>East</strong></td>
<td>Results for those residing in postcodes 2229 and 2230 (this area encompasses Taren Point)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Centre</strong></td>
<td>Results for those residing in postcodes 2224 and 2228</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>West</strong></td>
<td>Results for those residing in postcodes 2225, 2226, 2227, 2232 and 2234</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Summary Findings

- Ward C residents already recognise that the area’s population is growing, and hold concerns that this may make existing living pressures – notably traffic, housing density and job opportunities – worse.
- These residents are as yet unaware of the Woolworths Taren Point supermarket proposal, but once introduced it receives immediate majority support of two-thirds (with only less than a fifth opposed to any extent). This is positive.
- It must be stated that shopping facilities are not a salient issue right now, and some in Ward C find current facilities adequate, but this majority support does stem from desired choice, competition and convenience in light of growth.
- Further, local residents do not seem to view this proposed supermarket as part of an ‘over-development problem’; instead, agreeing that it will help to service the population, provide jobs and facilitate urban renewal at Taren Point.
- They do not generally believe that this new supermarket would necessarily solve their very salient traffic issues, but also do not think they would be made worse either (and would reduce at least some people’s travel and parking times).
- Indeed, the only consistent reason for the minority opposition is that some do not see that a store is needed right now, e.g. they may have others closer.
Road issues are the dominant local bugbear in Ward C right now, followed by development (relating to growth), with other spontaneous issues less salient.

Planning & development comments tend to relate to population growth, residential ‘over-development’ (inc. density and high-rise buildings), and a lack of infrastructure to service this growth.

N.B. There were no spontaneous mentions of supermarkets or Woolworths as local issues.

Q) What are the most important issues of concern to you in your local area that you would like your local council or representatives to do something about? What else? What else?
Taking into account the small sample in Ward C in March, there is not a great deal of change in their issue agenda, though ‘growth’ concerns have risen.

Q) What are the most important issues of concern to you in your local area that you would like your local council or representatives to do something about? What else? What else?
On prompted basis the focus on traffic is also apparent, but also employment, residential growth and the need for renewal. Shopping is a lesser issue.

Q) Now I’m going to read you some local issues and situations other people we have surveyed have said are important to the local area…important, somewhat important, not very important or not at all important.

Easing local traffic congestion (95%)

Measures to tackle unemployment, and especially youth unemployment* (85%)

The need for more job opportunities in the area (84%)

Over-development, such as too much housing, in the local area (81%)

The pressures of population and housing growth in the region* (81%)

The need for improved public amenities, such as parks, sports grounds and community clubs (73%)

The need for urban renewal in Taren Point so that it is more vibrant and attractive* (53%)

Availability of and access to grocery stores and supermarkets (51%)

The need to improve the quality and variety of shops and services in the local area (42%)

Very important

Somewhat important

Don’t know

Unimportant

N.B. Sorted by Total important (given in brackets)
A clear majority of Ward C residents are aware that the area is growing, and will continue to do so, with obvious consequences for those issues.

Q) The Sutherland Shire Council area is the second most populous in the State, and according to the ABS the population has grown steadily for the last decade. Before today, were you aware that the local area’s population was growing in this manner?
However, awareness of the proposed Woolworths Store at Taren Point is extremely low, so this is not yet factored in to their issues or the potential benefits.

Q) Recognising the population growth, Woolworths is planning a new supermarket, where old industrial buildings currently are, in your local area at Taren Point… Before today, were you aware of this proposed new Woolworths store at Taren Point?
Whilst low awareness means that there is scope for (weak) opinion to change, the prejudice is very much in favour of the Woolworths store proposal.

Q) Based on your experiences of shopping in the Shire, would you support or oppose a Woolworths supermarket like this in Taren Point?
This majority support is felt in all areas of Ward C, including the immediate East area encompassing Taren Point.

Q) Based on your experiences of shopping in the Shire, would you support or oppose a Woolworths supermarket like this in Taren Point?
The themes of general improvement (renewal), jobs, convenience and accessibility, and the need to meet growth are the top reasons for this support.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Reason</th>
<th>Percentage</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Will improve the area</td>
<td>14%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Creates jobs</td>
<td>12%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Accessibility</td>
<td>12%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Not one there</td>
<td>9%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Better for the locals</td>
<td>9%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>More convenient</td>
<td>9%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Growth driving demand for stores</td>
<td>8%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Need more parking/Good for parking</td>
<td>7%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Does not effect me</td>
<td>6%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Needs variety</td>
<td>6%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Needs competition</td>
<td>6%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Reduces traffic</td>
<td>6%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Gives people more options</td>
<td>5%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Other stores are too crowded/Takes pressure off other stores</td>
<td>5%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Only have an IGA</td>
<td>3%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Q) Why do you support the Taren Point supermarket proposal? Why else?

Ward C Dec 2016
Opposition is largely confined to oversupply, though there are also some concerns about traffic effects.

Q) Why do you oppose the Taren Point supermarket proposal? Why else?

- Already too many supermarkets: 37%
- Would be bad for traffic/already has bad traffic: 14%
- Already too many Woolworths: 11%
- Already too many shops: 11%
- Prefer independent stores/Dont like the Monopoly/Bad for local business: 10%
- Dont need it: 10%
- Already too many shopping centres: 8%
- Dont like Woolworths: 8%
- Could use the area for better things (e.g. more space for business, parks, other development): 5%
- Prefer other stores (e.g. Cole, COSTCO): 4%
- Doesnt effect me: 2%

Ward C Dec 2016
The messages to most resonate with locals relate to consumer choice / competition, jobs and business, convenience and the need for urban renewal.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Statement</th>
<th>Strongly agree</th>
<th>Somewhat agree</th>
<th>Don’t know</th>
<th>Disagree</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>I prefer shopping at larger supermarkets with a full range of products at reasonable prices (77%)</td>
<td>46%</td>
<td>31%</td>
<td>2%</td>
<td>21%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>There should be more retail jobs available in the Shire as unemployment is a big issue (74%)</td>
<td>35%</td>
<td>38%</td>
<td>6%</td>
<td>21%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Shoppers and residents would benefit from more convenient supermarket and shopping options (72%)</td>
<td>32%</td>
<td>41%</td>
<td>3%</td>
<td>25%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Supermarkets support other nearby businesses by attracting shoppers to the area (72%)</td>
<td>34%</td>
<td>38%</td>
<td>2%</td>
<td>25%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Local residents would benefit from a more competitive local retail sector (72%)</td>
<td>34%</td>
<td>39%</td>
<td>2%</td>
<td>26%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Thinking of parking and travel time, it would be good to have a convenient and accessible store nearby (66%)</td>
<td>32%</td>
<td>34%</td>
<td>4%</td>
<td>30%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The industrial buildings around Taren Point are empty and ugly—we need renewal of this area (63%)</td>
<td>30%</td>
<td>33%</td>
<td>8%</td>
<td>29%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A new, local supermarket at Taren Point would improve my local community, by enabling people to shop close to home (60%)</td>
<td>24%</td>
<td>36%</td>
<td>6%</td>
<td>34%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Q) now going to read out a list of statements that other people have said about supermarket and retail shopping in the Sutherland Shire. Regardless of your overall view, I want you to tell me whether you agree or disagree with each statement.
Messages around traffic and the need for closer and larger stores (given pop. growth) are less compelling, and there are some concerns about over-development.

There is too much development in the local area, and this just adds to that (55%)

Modelling shows that retail floor space is not keeping pace with population growth, so we need new stores (49%)

The Shire does not need more full-range supermarkets, such as Coles or Woolworths. (48%)

I would like to see more food and grocery shopping choices in the Shire, closer to me (48%)

The number of services and number of shopping centres in the Shire is not keeping pace with population growth (39%)

Putting a store into Taren Point may reduce the freight traffic on local roads (33%)

It takes too long to travel to my preferred supermarket or grocery store so I need something closer to me (21%)

Q) now going to read out a list of statements that other people have said about supermarket and retail shopping in the Sutherland Shire. Regardless of your overall view, I want you to tell me whether you agree or disagree with each statement.

Strongly agree  Somewhat agree  Don't know  Disagree

N.B. Sorted by Total important (given in brackets)